# EXECUTIVE SUMMARY IN HARRY'S RESTRICTIVE ABORTION LAW



#### © 2010 Center for Reproductive Rights

Printed in the United States

Any part of this report may be copied, translated, or adapted with permission from the authors, provided that the parts copied are distributed free or at cost (not for profit) and the Center for Reproductive Rights is acknowledged as the author. Any commercial reproduction requires prior written permission from the Center for Reproductive Rights. The Center for Reproductive Rights would appreciate receiving a copy of any materials in which information from this report is used.

#### **Center for Reproductive Rights**

120 Wall Street, 14th Floor New York, NY 10005 United States Tel +1 917 637 3600 Fax +1 917 637 3666 publications@reprorights.org

#### www.reproductiverights.org

# EXECUTIVE SUMMARY IN HARRA'S RESTRICTIVE ABORTION LAW

### **OUR MISSION**

The Center for Reproductive Rights uses the law to advance reproductive freedom as a fundamental human right that all governments are legally obligated to protect, respect, and fulfill.

## **OUR VISION**

Reproductive freedom lies at the heart of the promise of human dignity, self-determination, and equality embodied in both the U.S. Constitution and the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. The Center works toward the time when that promise is enshrined in law in the United States and throughout the world. We envision a world where every woman is free to decide whether and when to have children; where every woman has access to the best reproductive healthcare available; where every woman can exercise her choices without coercion or discrimination. More simply put, we envision a world where every woman participates with full dignity as an equal member of society.

#### The Research for this Report

**The Center for Reproductive Rights** has worked on issues related to Kenyan healthcare for several years and issued two previous human rights fact-finding reports documenting violations of women's human rights with respect to women's experiences with family planning, pregnancy, and childbirth in Kenyan healthcare facilities as well as the barriers to quality healthcare experienced by women living with HIV. These reports laid the foundation for understanding the complexities of Kenya's healthcare system as well as its strengths and weaknesses. *In Harm's Way* clearly demonstrates that the weaknesses in Kenya's healthcare system documented in these reports are further exacerbated when it comes to a medical procedure that is perceived as illegal and heavily stigmatized.

The information in this report is based on research and interviews conducted by the Center between June 2009 and February 2010. The Center gathered the experiences of 59 women through a combination of in-depth interviews and focus group discussions. The Center also conducted site visits to private and public healthcare facilities and spoke to healthcare providers and administrators. Leaders and reproductive health focal points of medical associations, officials at health professionals' licensing and regulatory bodies, officials at the Ministry of Health's Division of Reproductive Health, leaders of organizations focused on training providers to offer abortion-related services, and professors and lecturers at provider training schools were also interviewed for this report. In addition, the Center reviewed government guidelines, standards, and manuals on issues pertaining to reproductive health services, with a particular focus on abortion and post-abortion care, and media coverage of abortion-related issues in Kenya over the past few years. Finally, data from public health studies on abortion in Kenya were also used to provide a broader context and supplement the information gleaned from interviews and media reports.

## UNSAFE ABORTION IN KENYA

KIBERA, on the outskirts of Nairobi, is the largest informal settlement in Kenya.

## Sarah's Story

Sarah was 14 years old when she died from complications from unsafe abortion. She lived in a one-room shack in the heart of Kibera—Kenya's largest informal settlement—with her mother, four siblings and two nieces. Her father had died of AIDS and tuberculosis. Her mother, Evelyne, is HIV-positive and was hospitalized for two years with tuberculosis complications, suffering spinal damage; she was wheelchair bound for months after discharge and has permanent limited mobility.

Sarah left school at age 13 to support her family. When she couldn't find work washing clothes for other women, she would have sex with men. These men typically refused to pay for sex unless it was "flesh to flesh"—without a condom. She would use the 100 Kenyan shillings (\$1.30) earned from these encounters to buy food for the family.

When Sarah became pregnant, another woman in Kibera advised her to get an abortion. Sarah told her mother she was going to visit her aunt and, instead, procured an unsafe abortion from the woman's friend. Afterwards, Sarah developed a dangerous, life-threatening infection that left her in great pain and bedridden for a month. Upon hearing of Sarah's condition, the woman who advised her fled the area.

The cost of emergency healthcare and the fear of arrest kept Sarah from seeking medical care. Only when the infection had progressed significantly did her mother discover the extent of her condition. The only care she received was her mother's attempts to wash the wound with Dettol, a disinfectant.

Sarah and her mother were afraid to talk to anyone about how sick she was because of the risk of arrest and the fear of community condemnation. They could not raise the money to take her to the hospital because, unlike with other emergencies or illnesses in Kenya where poorer communities rally to help their own, no one would contribute if they knew it was for complications of abortion. Sarah's post-abortion care would have cost less than 2,000 shillings (\$26).

Sarah died at home on June 29, 2009. Her family now goes for days without food and survives on handouts from neighbors. The landlord is threatening to evict her family from their one-room shack because they cannot afford the 800 shillings (\$10) monthly rent. It is unclear where they will go or how they will live once evicted from Kibera.<sup>1</sup>

#### **Overview**

#### A Preventable Epidemic of Maternal Mortality from Kenya's Restrictive Abortion Law

I have seen so much misery at the Kenyatta National Hospital. . . where women with abortion-related problems have died and others lost uteruses. There is no doubt the existing laws are colonial and too strict in the modern society.<sup>1</sup>

—Professor Julius Meme, Permanent Secretary in the Kenyan Ministry of Health, 1999

Unsafe abortion claims the lives of thousands of Kenyan women each year. Their deaths are entirely and easily preventable. Yet the Kenyan government has done little to address the problem. Kenya's abortion fatality rates are substantially higher than in the African region as a whole and more than nine times higher than for developed regions.<sup>2</sup> In Kenya, 35% of maternal deaths are attributable to unsafe abortion.<sup>3</sup> These deaths are a direct consequence of Kenya's abortion law, one of the most restrictive in the world.

The impact on Kenyan women, girls, and families from the law is devastating. In Kenya, a woman wanting to safely terminate an unwanted pregnancy must negotiate a maze of misinformation as well as personal, financial, and bureaucratic barriers, due to the stigma, lack of legal clarity, and prohibitive costs surrounding the procedure.

Shortcomings in the provision of reproductive health care heighten the risk of unwanted pregnancy, forcing women to turn to unsafe abortion and its life-threatening risks. A lack of contraception and clear information about family planning, combined with intolerably high levels of sexual violence and inconsistent access to emergency contraception, trap women and girls into unwanted pregnancies.

Schoolgirls are particularly vulnerable when faced with unwanted pregnancies and may lose their opportunity to complete their education due to the stigma surrounding adolescent pregnancy. Despite policies in place to prevent this practice, Kenyan schools often expel pregnant girls once their pregnancies are discovered. Girls who risk procuring an often unsafe abortion in an effort to remain in school are also often faced with expulsion, leaving girls facing an unwanted pregnancy with few opportunities to successfully complete their secondary school education.

Criminalization of abortion means that women and girls with unwanted or unplanned pregnancies even those who could seek a legal abortion—resort to treatment from herbalists and unqualified individuals, seeking medical care only for advanced infections. The cost of treatment for these complications varies widely and can be increased even further by requests for bribes by health care providers. In addition, women may find themselves detained in health care facilities if they are unable to pay their medical bills after receiving post-abortion care.

A lack of clarity about legal access to abortion has produced widespread misinformation among medical providers as well, resulting in denials of access to safe abortion even where permitted under

the law. Further, medical centers lack trained personnel and equipment to perform post-abortion care, and the stigma surrounding even legitimate post-abortion care exposes women to verbal abuse and the withholding of available pain management by providers. Those medical providers who do provide services under the law run the risk of arbitrary prosecution by police, shake-downs by extortionists, and public shaming.

The result is an epidemic of maternal mortality that could be prevented with better funding for family planning and provider training, accurate provider and public education on sexual health and the law, and legal reform that better supports providers and decriminalizes abortion.

Our report – a comprehensive look at the full spectrum of failures affecting the reproductive health of women in Kenya – extensively documents the devastating effects of this system upon women, girls, families and providers of medical care, using interviews with officials and medical providers, focus group research, site visits, and a review of relevant laws, guidelines and media reports related to the issue.

As we demonstrate, this failure to protect the lives of women and girls also has consequences under international law, constituting violations of human rights under both the African Charter's Protocol on the Rights of Women in Africa (Maputo Protocol) and treaty interpretations overseen by international human rights bodies. The rights violations documented in this report make clear that the lack of access to safe abortion is responsible for the deaths and health burdens of thousands of women and seriously undermines the quality of care both provided and received in Kenyan healthcare facilities.

While our focus is on Kenya, the problem of unsafe abortion in restrictive and unclear legal and policy environments is far from unique. Many Commonwealth African countries that have not reformed their abortion laws confront the same issues detailed in this report, including the devastating effect of unsafe abortion on women and their families, the lack of clarity in abortion laws and policies, and inadequate training in safe abortion and post-abortion care.

#### Current Kenyan Constitutional Reform Process Includes Consideration of Even More Harmful Abortion Restrictions

The findings presented in this report take on particular importance now, as some in Kenya work to introduce language into its proposed new constitution that may restrict access to safe abortion even further. Language proposed for inclusion in the Bill of Rights states that "the life of a person begins at conception." An additional proposed clause could prohibit abortion in nearly all cases in Kenya.

Yet this fact-finding makes clear that restrictive abortion laws do not in fact prevent women from having abortions. Instead, prohibitions on access to abortion simply prevent women from having safe abortions and severely undermine the quality of abortion and post-abortion care services provided to women in need. They further place an enormous burden on a healthcare system that is ill-equipped to handle the number of women requiring post-abortion care, a healthcare service that is stigmatized, and therefore neglected, as a consequence of the criminalization of abortion.

Given the consequences of such restrictions, the inclusion of the language being proposed would fly in the face of the purposes of constitutional reform. Constitutions, particularly their Bill of Rights, are rightsaffirming documents that seek to provide a framework within which all members of society can have their rights protected, promoted, and respected.

Prohibiting a medical procedure needed only by women fails to recognize women as full members of society, with equal rights to life, health, equality, dignity, and freedom from torture and cruel, inhuman, or degrading treatment, among others. In addition, constitutional language stating that life begins at conception is directly at odds with international human rights law. International and African regional human rights treaties and the official bodies that interpret their provisions do not extend "right to life" protections to fetuses. Furthermore, they support the position that recognizing the right to life from conception would interfere significantly with women's basic human rights.

## The Intolerably High Cost of the Abortion Restrictions for the Kenyan Medical System and Kenyan Women

The considerable cost of unsafe abortion on the healthcare system, providers, and women is largely a function of Kenya's restrictive abortion law. In addition to forcing women to resort to unsafe abortions—and thereby creating the high demand for post-abortion care—criminalizing abortion also drives up the cost of abortion services and can cause women to wait until their second trimester, when they have saved up enough money, to seek termination services. This practice is accompanied by greater complications, longer hospital stays, and, inevitably, greater use of the health system's resources.

Criminalization also prevents women from seeking timely post-abortion care due to fear, a lack of knowledge about services, stigma, and the often-prohibitive cost of post-abortion care. Thus, many women go to public or private hospitals only when complications are severe and complex, requiring more resources and extended hospital stays, delay which also extends their suffering and increases their risk of dying from infection or other causes.

Healthcare providers who offer post-abortion care or abortion services are also significantly affected by Kenya's restrictive abortion law in both their professional work and their personal lives. Providers and their families encounter police and community harassment, are forced to pay bribes to police, are criminally prosecuted, face employment discrimination due to the stigma surrounding abortion, and struggle with the internal personal and professional tension that the law creates, pitting their duty to save lives and promote health against their obligation to obey the law.

A 2004 study conducted by Ipas and the Ministry of Health provides some insight into the financial impact on the healthcare system, estimating that the total "annual direct cost for treating incomplete abortions presenting to public hospitals is approximately 18.4 million Kshs [\$242,105]. About Ksh[s] 11.5 million [\$151,316] (62% of the total) are spent on treating unsafely induced abortions."<sup>4</sup> This is a conservative figure—the World Health Organization notes that "[m]ore than any other aspect of sexual and reproductive ill-health, abortion suffers from gross underreporting."<sup>5</sup> Kenyan gynecologist J.K.G. Mati has suggested that "a very conservative estimate of the annual cost to Kenya [of the management of botched abortion] is of the order of 250–300 million shillings [\$3.3–4 million approximately]."<sup>6</sup> In addition, criminalization of abortion in Kenya has created an environment in which unsafe abortion has become a public-health crisis that most healthcare administrators and policymakers are content—and permitted—to ignore. Ultimately, reducing the cost burden to both women and the healthcare system of unsafe abortion is simply a matter of providing safe, accessible abortion services. Steps must also be taken to educate providers, adolescents and women about the actual scope of current abortion law, including the availability of post-abortion care and government policies which emphasize its critical role in saving women's lives. The government must also make clear that post-abortion care is a legal service and that women seeking such care will not be arrested or prosecuted under any circumstances.

#### **Conclusions in Brief**

#### A System in Crisis from Contraception to Post-Abortion Care

## CONCLUSION ONE: ACCESS TO CONTRACEPTION IS PRECARIOUS FOR BOTH MARRIED AND UNMARRIED WOMEN

#### The context:

- Kenyan women experience high rates of unwanted and unplanned pregnancies and have limited access to contraceptives and family planning information.
- According to the 2003 Kenya Demographic and Health Survey (KDHS), "nearly 20 percent of births in Kenya are unwanted and [an additional] 25 percent are mistimed (wanted later)."<sup>7</sup>
- According to the 2009 KDHS Preliminary Report, the modern contraceptive prevalence rate for married women is 39%.<sup>8</sup> The 2003 KDHS also found that 25% of married women in Kenya have an unmet need for family planning; the unmet need is even higher than 25% for women aged 15–24 and 30–34.<sup>9</sup>

#### **Research conclusions:**

- Women encounter multiple barriers to contraceptive access. Access to contraceptives in Kenya is limited by the government's failure to ensure an adequate and consistent supply of contraceptives and the effective dissemination of accurate family planning information, financial barriers to contraceptive access, and discriminatory service prOovision stemming from the stigma surrounding women's and girls' sexuality in Kenya.
  - i. The Kenyan government's failure to procure sufficient contraceptive stocks has meant that Kenya's public health facilities have consistently suffered from severe shortages, or "stock-outs," of contraceptives in recent years.<sup>10</sup>
  - ii. The Kenyan government has failed to effectively disseminate accurate family planning information. According to the 2003 KDHS, 25% of women<sup>11</sup> and 29% of men<sup>12</sup> had not been exposed to family planning messages through the media, including radio, television and newspapers/magazines, in the months preceding the survey.
  - iii. In addition to supply shortages, Kenyans also face financial barriers to obtaining contraceptives. Despite the Ministry of Health's policy that contraceptives should be available free of charge, the 2004 Kenya Service Provision Assessment Survey (2004 KSPAS) found that 42% of government facilities charged user fees for family planning services and 8% of government facilities charged for the contraceptive method itself.<sup>13</sup> The private sector poses similar financial obstacles to contraceptives access. Although private drug stores do have contraceptives consistently in stock, their prices are often too expensive for most Kenyans.<sup>14</sup>

- A lack of meaningful access to a comprehensive range of contraceptive methods puts women and girls at a greater risk of unintended pregnancy.
  - iv. Reported *The Standard*, "[p]oor women who cannot afford contraceptives are turning to uncertified herbal medicines," which pose life-threatening side effects and are of questionable effectiveness.<sup>15</sup>
  - iv. According to the current Minister of Medical Services Anyang' Nyong'o, unintended pregnancies from poor access to contraceptives have driven up the rate of illegal abortions.<sup>16</sup>

## CONCLUSION TWO: KENYAN ADOLESCENTS ARE ILL-INFORMED ABOUT SEXUAL HEALTH AND LACK ACCESS TO CONTRACEPTION

#### The context:

- Kenya has high rates of teenage pregnancies and Kenyan youth receive limited sexuality education in schools.<sup>17</sup>
- An estimated 5.5 million Kenyan girls between the ages of 15 and 19 give birth annually.
- Youth in Kenya lack basic information about sex and reproductive health. Although the 2003 KDHS found that 52.8% of women aged 20–49 and 57.4% of men aged 20–54 had sex by their 18th birthday,<sup>18</sup> sex education in secondary schools in Kenya is limited<sup>19</sup> and, in some cases, nonexistent.<sup>20</sup>

#### **Research conclusions:**

- Lack of information and widespread misinformation about sexuality and reproductive health leads to unwanted pregnancies. With minimal, and sometimes inaccurate, information about contraceptives and family planning at their disposal, many Kenyans—adolescents, in particular—are ill equipped to prevent unwanted pregnancies.
  - Misinformation about sexuality and pregnancy prevention is widespread: one example is a 17-year-old boy from St. Georges Boys Secondary School in Kilifi, who was told that "if one has sex while standing, pregnancy will not occur."<sup>21</sup>
- Adolescents are often unaware of available family planning services. A focus group discussion
  held by the Center for Reproductive Rights with young women and girls in Mombasa, many
  of whom believed they could not afford EC, revealed that many did not know that emergency
  contraception is free in government facilities.<sup>22</sup> Further, focus group participants from Kibera
  voiced the belief that family planning was exclusively for married women; as one participant
  stated, "we are not married so family planning is not for us."<sup>23</sup>

#### CONCLUSION THREE: UNWANTED PREGNANCY, DISCRIMINATION AGAINST PREGNANT Schoolgirls, and abortion stigma dramatically reduce educational opportunities for school-age girls

#### The context:

- Girls in Kenyan schools are exposed to sexual abuse, receive limited sexuality education particularly about access to safe abortion, and may be forced to drop out or are expelled by the school administration upon becoming pregnant.
- The lack of sexuality education in Kenyan schools, poor access to information about sexual and reproductive health more generally, sexual coercion and violence and limited access to reproductive health services for Kenyan youths has led to high rates of teenage pregnancy in Kenya. According to the 2003 KDHS, 37.7% of girls have begun child-bearing by the age of 18;<sup>24</sup> and 13% of secondary students surveyed nationally had experienced their first pregnancy by age 14.<sup>25</sup>

- A 2009 report by the Teachers Service Commission (TSC) and the Centre for Rights Education and Awareness estimated that 12,660 girls were sexually abused by their teachers in Kenya between 2003 and 2007. These numbers may be underestimates given the report's finding that "90 percent of sexual abuses cases never reached the TSC."<sup>26</sup>
- Pregnant girls are often expelled or forced to leave school once teachers and school administrators discover the pregnancy. Despite government policies designed to protect a pregnant girl's right to continue her education, 13,000 girls leave school every year in Kenya due to pregnancy, according to a recent study by the Centre for the Study of Adolescence.<sup>27</sup> As a result, only 35% of Kenyan girls between the ages of 16 and 20 are still in school, while almost half of boys the same age are, despite the similarity of enrollment numbers when the boys and girls were younger.<sup>28</sup>

#### **Research conclusions:**

- Sexual violence, in the form of rape and gang rape, was a significant component of Kenya's post-election violence in 2007–08. The Commission of Inquiry into Post-election Violence dedicated an entire chapter of its final report to sexual violence, documenting testimonial evidence from both survivors and medical professionals relating to the marked increase in sexual offenses during the post-election violence. Witnesses testifying before the Commission reported "unwanted pregnancies, including the cases of two 14 and 16 year old girls who had been raped after which they found themselves doubly burdened."
- Pregnant girls cite the stigma of pregnancy and discrimination by teachers and peers as the main reason that they are forced to leave school.<sup>29</sup> Girls who attempt to return to school after pregnancy face humiliation and isolation—according to a 2008 study, fellow students "do not interact with them freely, partly at the instigation of teachers, who view the returning students as a bad influence."<sup>30</sup>
- Teachers and school administrators sometimes refuse to allow girls to return to school after giving birth for fear that "other girls would think that it is okay to get pregnant."<sup>31</sup> Since the girls may lack strong support systems, they often are not in a position to challenge mistreatment or expulsion.<sup>32</sup> According to news reports, at the Marinyn Secondary School in James Finlay Tea Estates in Kericho, all but one of twenty-five girls in the 2009 Form One class were forced to drop out of school due to pregnancy;<sup>33</sup> similarly, twenty-eight girls between the ages of 11and 15 dropped out of a primary school in Kinango District in 2009 after becoming pregnant.<sup>34</sup>
- Many schoolgirls, unwilling to risk their education because they have become pregnant, terminate their pregnancy in order to continue their education. According to the 2006 study on Kenyan adolescents' abortion discourse, "[s]econdary school students are more likely to pursue abortion as a strategy than their out-of-school age peers."<sup>35</sup>
- In seeking abortion, young women risk—and sometimes lose—their lives.
  - i. The case of a young orphan girl is one such example. In spite of being orphaned, she had scored top marks on her KCPE (Kenya Certificate of Primary Education) exam and her local Minister of Parliament was helping to fundraise for her school fees. When she discovered that she was pregnant and would not be able to continue on her promising educational path, she sought an illegal, unsafe abortion. She bled to death from the procedure.<sup>36</sup>
  - ii. The consensus during a Center for Reproductive Rights focus group discussion among adolescents and young women in Kibera, a large informal settlement in Nairobi, was that "you cannot go to a public hospital for an abortion."<sup>37</sup> Instead, the girls agreed that "the most common way to get an abortion is backstreet and when that fails you go to the hospital."<sup>38</sup>
- Procuring an abortion can also mean risking one's education, placing pregnant girls in an impossible situation. In the early months of 2009, Mary, a young girl in secondary school in Mbita, became pregnant. An orphan who lived with her grandmother, Mary realized that being

pregnant and having a child would not allow her to continue with her education. She went to a private provider in Mbita to have the abortion and then returned to school. According to her close friend, who was interviewed for this report, "The teachers knew she had been pregnant. She started bleeding in school, behind the classroom. The teacher called her and said to go to home and be pregnant again. If she couldn't do that, she shouldn't come back. Now she's at home and this has made her not finish school. She won't go back to school because she was chased away."<sup>39</sup>

## CONCLUSION FOUR: SEXUAL VIOLENCE AND "SURVIVAL SEX" IS PREVALENT AND LEADS TO UNWANTED PREGNANCIES AND UNSAFE ABORTION

#### The context:

- High rates of sexual violence in Kenya, particularly during the post-election violence in 2008-09, contribute to unwanted pregnancies.
- In a 2003 survey of 1,652 Kenyan women between the ages of 17 and 77, 52% reported being sexually abused in their lifetime while over 30% reported an experience of forced sexual intercourse in their lifetime.<sup>40</sup>
- According to the 2003 Kenya Demographic and Health Survey (2003 KDHS), "[m]arital rape appears to be common, with 15 percent of married women and separated or divorced women reporting having experienced forced sexual intercourse; 12 percent report this experience in the 12 months preceding the survey."<sup>41</sup>
- A 2008 United States Agency for International Development (USAID) study determined that Kenya has one of the highest rates of sexual violence between intimate partners of the ten countries surveyed, at 15%.<sup>42</sup> The data also indicated a statistically significant relationship between intimate partner violence and unintended pregnancies.<sup>43</sup> According to the same study, in Kenya, a slightly higher percentage of abortions are procured by women who have experienced intimate partner violence than by those who have not.<sup>44</sup>

#### **Research conclusions:**

- Sexual violence, in the form of rape and gang rape, was a significant component of Kenya's post-election violence in 2007–08. The Commission of Inquiry into Post-election Violence dedicated an entire chapter of its final report to sexual violence, documenting testimonial evidence from both survivors and medical professionals relating to the marked increase in sexual offenses during the post-election violence. Witnesses testifying before the Commission reported "unwanted pregnancies, including the cases of two 14 and 16 year old girls who had been raped after which they found themselves doubly burdened."<sup>45</sup>
  - As the Women's Commission for Refugee Women and Children documented following the post-election violence,

Cases of women and girls suffering from unsafe abortion had been reported in camps [for internally displaced persons]. Nakuru Showground clinic reported that in the week preceding the interview alone, there were two patients, one a 16-year-old who had used a pen and the other a 20-year-old who had used a coat hanger. The two women had come to the clinic for infection treatment.<sup>46</sup>

• Sexual violence and coercion in schools is a serious problem. A recent study by the Centre for the Study of Adolescence found that at least one in twenty boys in high school reported coercing girls into sex; the same number of boys reported having made a girl pregnant. One class were forced to drop out of school due to pregnancy; similarly, twenty-eight girls between the ages of 11and 15 dropped out of a primary school in Kinango District in 2009 after

becoming pregnant.47

Many poor women and girls turn to "survival sex" out of economic desperation. Due to the
worsening economic situation and devastating economic impact of the post-election violence
that left hundreds of thousands of Kenyans internally displaced,<sup>48</sup> poor women and girls
sometimes engage in "survival sex"—trading sexual acts for basic life necessities. A 2003
study by the Center for the Study of Adolescence found that 56% of secondary school
students "had exchanged sex for money."<sup>49</sup>

## CONCLUSION FIVE: EMERGENCY CONTRACEPTION (EC), EVEN FOR VICTIMS OF SEXUAL VIOLENCE, IS LARGELY UNAVAILABLE; ACCESS TO EC IS HINDERED BY DISCRIMINATION AND MISINFORMATION

#### The context:

- The Ministry of Health's Sexual Violence Guidelines state that "[i]n view of the psychological consequences of conceiving after being raped, every non-pregnant woman/girl of childbearing age not covered by a reliable form of contraception, should be offered emergency contraception."<sup>50</sup>
- The Ministry of Health's 2008 EC guidelines for healthcare providers state that "EC is used after unprotected sex" and does not limit the situations in which it can be dispensed.<sup>51</sup> They further state that "EC can be safely used by adolescents."<sup>52</sup>
- EC is also supposed to be available free at public health facilities.<sup>53</sup>

#### **Research conclusions:**

- Many women who have survived sexual violence never receive emergency contraception (EC). The reasons for this vary. For some women, a lack of transportation prevents them from seeking medical attention; for others, the stigma associated with sexual violence and rape deters them from obtaining healthcare. Supplies of EC are also unavailable at hospitals and clinics that are Catholic facilities and those under the Christian Health Association of Kenya.<sup>54</sup>
- The time period for intervention using EC is sometimes interpreted too narrowly by providers. Kenya's Sexual Violence Guidelines state that EC can be given up to 72 hours after rape.<sup>55</sup> Yet this is inconsistent with the World Health Organization's recommendations<sup>56</sup> and the Ministry of Health's guidelines on EC, which state that EC should be used "as soon as possible, but within 120 hours of unprotected sex."<sup>57</sup> Many of the healthcare providers interviewed for this report asserted that EC had to be administered within 72 hours.<sup>58</sup>
- Despite the clear public demand for EC, Kenyan public health facilities are insufficiently stocked and face persistent shortages in supply. Maintaining consistent government stocks of emergency contraception has proven challenging in Kenya.<sup>59</sup> By the end of June 2009, only 0.3 months' worth of EC stock remained in government stores, whereas the minimum recommended stock is 10.3 months.<sup>60</sup>
- Interviews suggest women are being denied EC by providers and pharmacists on the basis of age and marital status and personal perceptions of "abuse" of EC, despite the fact that these are not valid reasons to withhold EC according to the Ministry of Health's 2008 EC guidelines for healthcare providers.<sup>61</sup>
- Accounts of arbitrary refusals to provide EC were common from the women and providers interviewed for this report. Young women and adolescents from Kibera who participated in a focus group discussion stated that "for EC they [government family planning facilities] normally prefer you to be 21 years or older."<sup>62</sup> This was corroborated by pharmacists. A programs pharmacist at a family planning center explained that the "reason why [pharmacists] would hold back contraceptives is because the person looks young."<sup>63</sup>

## CONCLUSION SIX: THE STIGMA OF ABORTION AND ITS CRIMINALIZED LEGAL STATUS IMPERILS WOMEN'S HEALTH

#### The context:

- Kenya's Penal Code lays out the penalties for a woman who obtains<sup>64</sup> an "unlawful" abortion, anyone who acts with the intent to "unlawfully" provide an abortion for a woman, and any person who supplies drugs or instruments to be used in the performance of an "unlawful" abortion.<sup>66</sup>
- The Penal Code can be read as creating a lawful exception to illegal abortion: when "a surgical operation...upon an unborn child" is performed "in good faith and with reasonable care" for the "preservation of the mother's life."<sup>67</sup> However, the provision offers no guidance as to what circumstances may constitute the preservation of the woman's life—and there is no post-independence Kenyan High Court case law that authoritatively interprets this provision and makes clear the content of this exception.
- There is no administrative or judicial procedure in place in Kenya to challenge—in a timely and effective manner—a health care provider's decision to decline a woman's request for a lawful abortion.<sup>68</sup>

#### **Research conclusions:**

- Women resort to painful and dangerous methods to terminate unwanted pregnancy. These methods include catheters,<sup>69</sup> crochet or knitting needles,<sup>70</sup> sticks,<sup>71</sup> pipes,<sup>72</sup> coils or wires,<sup>74</sup> and pens.<sup>74</sup> Other methods include ingesting dangerous substances or overdosing on medication, such as Jik (bleach) or a bluing agent (similar to bleach),<sup>75</sup> concentrated tea,<sup>76</sup> soapy water or detergent,<sup>77</sup> malaria pills, Cytotec or misoprosotol,<sup>78</sup> and herbs acquired from an herbalist.<sup>79</sup> Lastly, some methods involve deliberate bodily injury, such as falling down.<sup>80</sup>
- Women suffer from life-long complications and disabilities and death as a result of turning to unsafe abortion, including unsafe abortions performed by quacks. One obstetrician-gynecologist consultant at New Nyanza Provincial Hospital in Kisumu told the Center: "Recently, we had a student in Form 4 [secondary school] who went for a quack abortion, got infected, and went into septic shock. The infection spread to her brain and now she is a vegetable. Eight weeks later and she is still there at the Provincial Hospital, right now, and she can't talk."<sup>81</sup>
- Women seeking abortion services sometimes experience degrading treatment by providers, including verbal abuse and the denial of pain medication or anesthesia. A rape trauma counselor interviewed for this report told of a client who had sought an abortion after being brutally raped and becoming pregnant. The young woman went to a private facility in downtown Nairobi, recommended by her sister. Throughout the procedure, for which she was given no anesthesia, she was verbally abused by the two male providers who attended her. They said, "You will never do this again, come out and see what you have done so you don't go opening up your legs again to other men."<sup>82</sup> According to her lawyer, they "brought the fetus in a bucket and put it in her face and said you need to stop spreading your legs for everyone."<sup>83</sup> The woman suffered post-abortion complications from the procedure but refused to seek further care.<sup>84</sup>
- There are few avenues for redress for women who experience abuses during the provision of abortion-related healthcare services. One such example is a woman whose uterus was removed, without her consent, during an abortion procedure. In an interview for this report, an official with close ties to the Medical Board explained that the woman brought a complaint before the Board; the provider, upon being questioned by the Board about the case, said that whatever wrong he committed, the woman also had done something unlawful and therefore she should be prosecuted as well. The woman dropped the case.<sup>85</sup>
- Women in Kenya are regularly arrested for unlawfully procuring an abortion. A community
  organizer from Kibera noted that "many women have been arrested" on abortion charges.<sup>86</sup> A
  reproductive rights researcher who is currently collecting abortion decisions from magistrate's

courts across the country stated that in the lower courts in Nyeri and Kisumu, there are approximately three cases being tried per week in which women are charged with procuring an illegal abortion.<sup>87</sup>

- Of these cases not one of the women or girls tried had legal representation at trial.<sup>88</sup> Ten out of twenty cases examined involved schoolgirls, some of whom were minors.<sup>89</sup> In all the cases, the women pled guilty to the charges; as the researcher noted, "evidence doesn't even have to be called."<sup>90</sup>
- A long-time Kibera resident and the mother of a young girl who died from an unsafe abortion said that, in Kibera, "[e]veryone is afraid. People in Kibera get arrested. If they find a fetus somewhere they will search all the women in the area to see who is bleeding and they will turn the woman over to the chief and over to the police."<sup>91</sup>

#### CONCLUSION SEVEN: THE HIGH AND VARIABLE COST OF MEDICAL SERVICES IMPEDES ACCESS TO SAFE ABORTION, EVEN WHEN AVAILABLE UNDER LAW, DISPROPORTIONATELY AFFECTING YOUNG AND POOR WOMEN

#### The context:

- While Kenyan women with financial means usually have access to relatively safe abortions performed by private practitioners, most poor women must resort to unsafe and clandestine means.<sup>92</sup> Women qualifying for a legal abortion are rarely able to access a safe abortion in Kenya's public healthcare system.
- Poverty affects women disproportionately: female-headed households in Kenya experience higher incidences of poverty than their male counterparts, in both rural and urban areas.<sup>93</sup> In a country where almost 40% of the population lives on less than two dollars a day and 52% of the population lives below the national poverty line, safe abortion services are out of reach for many.<sup>94</sup>

#### **Research conclusions:**

• The cost of safe abortion services varies widely. It ranges from 500 shillings (\$6.50) to 9,000 shillings (\$118.00) from various providers. In contrast, herbalists and unqualified individuals may charge between 300–500 shillings (\$4–6.50) for their services.<sup>95</sup> A private provider in an informal settlement in Kisumu stated that:

Women know about private providers but still go to quacks because they are cheaper. Quacks induce and then [the women] go to a government hospital to complete. This is cheaper than going straight to providers but the risk is complications.<sup>96</sup>

• The high cost of safe abortion services is sometimes driven by the perceived blanket illegality of the procedure. As one clinical officer explained, "Because it's illegal, there are people that are overcharging the patients and extorting money from patients."<sup>97</sup>

## CONCLUSION EIGHT: DESPITE ITS CLEAR LEGALITY AND NECESSITY, SERIOUS BARRIERS IMPEDE ACCESS TO LIFE-SAVING POST-ABORTION CARE

#### The context:

• The Ministry of Health has made clear that "emergency care for complications of abortion (post-abortion care), both spontaneous and induced, is legal and not punishable by any part of Kenya laws."<sup>98</sup> According to its National Post Abortion Care Curriculum, comprehensive post-abortion care is "a life saving procedure that should be available to all women."<sup>99</sup> However, the curriculum does not address whether a woman seeking post-abortion care is

protected from punishment or arrest.

- The provision of post-abortion care is regulated by a number of policy documents issued by the Ministry of Health. These strategic plans, standards, and guidelines address service provision, the training of reproductive health service providers, and the minimum standards of care required for effective post-abortion care. Notably, there are no guidelines on fee structures for post-abortion care or fee exemptions or waivers for these services.
- There is a section containing technical guidelines on the management of complications of abortion within the Ministry of Health's Essential Obstetric Care Manual;<sup>100</sup> however, it is unclear the extent to which providers are aware of these guidelines. The Ministry has not published any technical guidelines focused exclusively on the provision of post-abortion care.
- Although community education and awareness-raising about existing post-abortion care services was a key component of the Ministry of Health's 2002 official standards for management of complications of unsafe abortion,<sup>101</sup> women remain unaware that post-abortion care is a legal service that should be available at government facilities.

#### **Research conclusions:**

- Women requiring post-abortion care must also overcome a series of obstacles to access care at a healthcare facility and to obtain quality care from the healthcare providers on duty. Barriers to access include the fear of prosecution and social stigma and the prohibitive costs associated with obtaining post-abortion care.
- Fear of arrest upon seeking post-abortion care services is not unfounded. A nurse who runs a maternity hospital in Nairobi and who provides post-abortion care stated that "there is a lot of threatening and mistreatment by the police. The police went to a clinic in Eastlands, found women in the waiting room [who were thought to be seeking abortion-related services] and they were all picked up."<sup>102</sup>
- Women delay seeking care because they fear social stigma. A nurse who works both at a government facility and operates a private practice in Suba District, explained that the law deters and delays women's access to post-abortion care: "Women may not seek post-abortion care because of the restriction from the government. They are afraid of the law. Women delay coming for treatment and then only come when they are worse."<sup>103</sup> These delays can create additional barriers to care, as lower cadres of providers are often not equipped to handle serious complications and may need to refer women to a different facility, resulting in greater costs for care and transport.
- In some cases, the fear of stigma is lethal. In a focus group discussion in Mombasa conducted by the Center for Reproductive Rights, young women told of others they knew who had died from unsafe abortion: "One went to a quack at four months and bled to death. She didn't have the cash to pay for treatment and was ashamed so didn't want to go for treatment—she was a Muslim student and didn't go because of shame,"<sup>104</sup> recounted one participant. Another woman told of a relative who "tried to abort, took a concoction . . . started bleeding, locked herself in her room and when we opened the door she had already died."<sup>105</sup>
- Even when women do decide to obtain emergency care, their fear of the law presents additional barriers to immediate and effective care. For example, women may not be forthcoming about their medical history. According to a long-practicing nurse-midwife, "that is the biggest challenge as providers. You get the wrong history. They lie about the month of pregnancy. They say they are three months pregnant when they are really six months pregnant,"<sup>106</sup> making appropriate care more difficult to determine and risking the health complications of improper post-abortion care treatment.
- The cost of post-abortion care is a barrier. According to an obstetrician-gynecologist at the University of Nairobi, the "use of public services has gone down because of fees. This prevents women from seeking post-abortion care. . . . The fee is a major barrier to access.

Women might not come for services because they can't afford it."107

- The women interviewed for the report appeared unaware that a fee-waiver system exists in most public health facilities for those who are unable to afford the cost of services such as post-abortion care. The medical superintendent of Kisumu East District Hospital reinforced this proposition, asserting that "ignorance... that the fee can be waived" prevents women from seeking post-abortion care.<sup>108</sup> Nearly all of the public health providers interviewed, in contrast, mentioned the possibility of a fee waiver.<sup>109</sup>
- Extended care in serious cases can be very expensive. According to a doctor at Kenyatta National Hospital, one woman from an informal settlement in Nairobi who sought care after an unsafe abortion required two major abdominal surgeries, a stint in the intensive-care unit, and more than eight months' recovery in the hospital ward. Upon eventual discharge from the hospital, her total bill was 250,000 shillings (\$3,289).<sup>110</sup>
- Women interviewed for this report also consistently raised bribery as an obstacle to—and requirement for—obtaining care. In a focus group discussion with young women in Kibera, the participants agreed when one woman said, "The public hospitals will definitely ask for bribes [when providing post-abortion care]. They will threaten to turn you into the police unless you pay them."<sup>111</sup> At another focus group discussion with 19 young women in Mombasa, the consensus was that

people charge money on top because it's illegal. If you want them to take care of you immediately, you need to pay a bribe in a government hospital, otherwise they'll take you to the ward and leave you there all day. You bribe them so they don't call the police too.<sup>112</sup>

Bribes for post-abortion care services were perceived as common, revealed focus group discussions conducted by the Center for Reproductive Rights with women in Mombasa,<sup>113</sup> Kibera,<sup>114</sup> and Mbita<sup>115</sup> in Nyanza Province. The precise amount paid in bribes was unknown—"it's secret," agreed the women from Mbita.<sup>116</sup>

- Patients are sometimes detained in healthcare facilities when they are unable to pay their medical bills for post-abortion care. The hospital administration detains patients who cannot afford their fees upon discharge, holding them against their will until they find the requisite funds or until it is clear they cannot pay. In addition to holding them accountable for their original hospital fees, explains a newspaper article, "hospitals continue to charge detained patients an average of \$5 to \$7 a day, so their debt continues to grow like a high-interest credit card balance."<sup>117</sup>
- Detention due to medical debt can further discourage women from seeking post-abortion care and has serious consequences for women and their families. Prolonged detention, aside from constituting a serious human rights violation, may have additional ramifications for women's livelihoods and the welfare of family members dependent on them for survival—often the very reasons a woman may have risked her life to procure an unsafe abortion in the first place.

## CONCLUSION NINE: POST-ABORTION CARE, EVEN WHEN AVAILABLE, IS OFTEN DELAYED, LACKING IN QUALITY, AND CHARACTERIZED BY MISTREATMENT

#### The context:

- In the year prior to the 2004 Kenyan Service Provision Assessment Survey, only 5% of all service providers interviewed reported receiving in-service training on post-abortion care.<sup>118</sup> As a comparison, 25% of service providers reported receiving in-service training on preventing mother-to-child transmission of HIV<sup>119</sup> and 58% participated in a training course related to HIV/AIDS<sup>120</sup> in the 12 months preceding the survey.
- In 2006, the Ministry of Health drafted a National Reproductive Health Curriculum for Service

Providers to address and standardize the various curricula used in training.<sup>121</sup> The curriculum contains a unit on post-abortion care and is meant to apply to all reproductive health service providers in Kenya, explicitly including clinical officers and nurses.<sup>122</sup> However, implementation of the policy has been poor leading not only to continuing confusion over nurses' scope of practice,<sup>123</sup> but also to a failure to update existing curricula to comply with its requirements.<sup>124</sup>

• The Kenyan government's National Post Abortion Care Curriculum, in discussing maternal mortality, states, "These women leave behind millions of motherless children whose survival is precarious due to lack of maternal support and care. Children who are left motherless due to maternal mortality are up to ten times more likely to die within two years than children with two living parents."<sup>125</sup>

#### **Research conclusions:**

- A woman able to overcome the significant financial and social obstacles to seeking postabortion care can encounter a new set of barriers to obtaining quality post-abortion care at the healthcare facility. Delays in treatment, both deliberate and resource-based, are common. Care may be denied entirely for failure to pay a demanded bribe. When women do finally receive care, the quality of the care is often poor, characterized by verbal abuse from healthcare staff, poorly performed procedures by untrained providers lacking proficiency, and the absence of pain management.
- Inconsistent availability of blood in Kenya's blood banks may delay care and increase hospital fees for post-abortion care patients. A professor of OB/GYN at the University of Nairobi/ Kenyatta National Hospital, explained that one reason fees can be prohibitively high for some women seeking post-abortion care is because "blood is not easy to get so [women] have to wait a few days,"<sup>127</sup> thereby delaying their care and increasing their hospital bill.
- Lack of equipment, lack of infection control, and incorrect use of equipment leading to equipment breakdowns all contribute to the lack of availability and low quality of post-abortion care.
  - According to the 2004 KSPAS, among all facilities that offer delivery services in Kenya, only 16% have a vacuum aspirator and only 14% have a D&C kit.<sup>128</sup>
  - The capacity for infection control is limited in Kenyan healthcare facilities: 54% of government facilities, 52% of private-sector facilities, 84% of NGO-run facilities, and 73% faith-based facilities lack the capacity for full infection control, leaving the overall capacity for infection control in Kenya's healthcare system at 40%.<sup>129</sup>
  - Health facilities often face dual problems of a limited ability to sterilize equipment and control infection coupled with an insufficient supply of manual vacuum aspiration kits, creating a high risk of infection and delaying the provision of care. A nurse in a private clinic in Nairobi explained, "one kit is for ten patients so there are risks of infections."<sup>130</sup>
  - In addition, both public and private providers interviewed for this report attributed the insufficient number of MVA kits to the fact that kits were repeatedly breaking down.<sup>131</sup> Experts and practitioners attribute the breakdown in kits to a lack of sufficient training.<sup>132</sup> One reproductive health specialist said that he has seen providers perform MVA procedures without knowing how to use the kit; he observed one provider trying to do an MVA who "broke three kits in one go."<sup>133</sup> Not only does this lack of training have a considerable impact on the availability of supplies—but to endure repeated attempts to perform an MVA procedure makes worse an already traumatic situation for women. As the reproductive health specialist stated, "One wonders what the quality of care would be in such situations ..."<sup>134</sup>
- Providers' negative attitudes about post-abortion care were consistently identified by women and providers as a widespread problem in public health facilities, manifesting itself in mistreatment

#### from the withholding of care to verbal abuse.

- A clinical officer at a public district hospital typically sees his post-abortion care patients after they have seen a nurse. In his experience, "nurses are so abusive in their language. They say, 'You had sex, you had your excitement. Now you're crying, who will help you? We will just leave you to die.'"<sup>135</sup> As a result, he noted, most of the patients who experience such verbal abuse do not come back for follow-up care.<sup>136</sup>
- Such abuse occurs regardless of whether post-abortion care patients have had a spontaneous or induced abortion. A nurse manager of a different district hospital observed that:

[Women] who may need services may prefer not to come to the hospital. The attitude of the staff is wanting. They treat any patient, even if miscarriage naturally occurred, as criminal. Patients are reluctant to come because they don't want to be abused. The reception of patients is wanting. Attitudes need to change. Any abortion [spontaneous or induced] is treated as criminal until proven otherwise.<sup>137</sup>

In addition to facing verbal abuse, failing to provide women with anesthesia or pain medication while undergoing post-abortion care is not uncommon in Kenya. A 2004 study conducted by Ipas and the Ministry of Health on unsafe abortion in Kenya found that "[i]n general, women who presented at the hospitals with incomplete abortion, reported that the most traumatizing aspect of their abortion experience was the bleeding and the 'excruciating pain.' Women likely to have had induced abortion reported that they had undergone additional trauma from the surgical procedure, performed without the benefit of pain control."<sup>138</sup>

A reproductive healthcare specialist and trainer in manual vacuum aspiration (MVA) decried the practice of denying pain relief:

Patients have rights and according to me if you're going to do MVA without pain care it is an assault on the person. You're not treating them, it's like assaulting them physically which is very wrong and unethical. We make them know [trainees] that this is a painful procedure and we have a means of controlling that pain and it should be given. . . . So if you have a health facility where they don't have pain killers—there should be analgesics and local anesthetics in place.<sup>139</sup>

• **Post-abortion family planning counseling is inadequate.** Although "studies in Latin America and Africa have shown that after having an abortion patients will accept contraception at high rates [and that c]ontraceptive counseling and provision at the time of treatment reduced unintended pregnancies and repeat abortions by 50% over 1 year in Zimbabwe, compared with post-abortion patients who did not receive such services,"<sup>140</sup> family planning follow-up is only haphazardly available as part of post-abortion care.

A clinical officer at Kisumu East District Hospital explained that "family planning counseling after abortion depends on who sees you. Family planning is another section of the hospital. After I do [the procedure], they just go home. No family planning counseling."<sup>141</sup> The impact of this approach can be seen in the official post-abortion care statistics collected at the same hospital: less than 33% of women who received post-abortion care services between January and June 2009 left with a family planning method.<sup>142</sup> In June 2009 alone, according to the register, not one of the 17 post-abortion care patients who were treated in the facility took up a family planning method upon discharge.<sup>143</sup>

## CONCLUSION TEN: KEY MEDICAL PROVIDERS OF REPRODUCTIVE HEALTHCARE LACK TRAINING, EQUIPMENT, AND CLARITY ON THE LAW AND THEIR SCOPE OF PRACTICE

#### The context:

• The Kenyan healthcare system is not equipped to deal with the high rates of unsafe abortion

cases presenting at its healthcare facilities. According to the 2004 KSPAS, only 9% of hospitals, maternities, and health centers have the capacity to provide basic emergency obstetric care.<sup>144</sup> Only 6% of hospitals, maternities, and health centers in Kenya were found to offer comprehensive emergency obstetric services.<sup>145</sup>

- Although the Ministry of Health has made clear that all hospitals, maternities, and health centers are expected to be able to offer 24-hour services, the 2004 KSPAS found that only 57% of hospitals, 59% of maternities, and 20% of health centers have the basic components to support such services.<sup>146</sup> Only 11% of all government-managed facilities have the basic components to support 24-hour emergency services.<sup>147</sup>
- Kenyan healthcare facilities often lack basic equipment necessary for the provision of postabortion care and safe abortion, including clean latex gloves, soap, water, disinfecting solution, sterilization equipment, and the equipment used for post-abortion care.<sup>148</sup>

#### **Research conclusions:**

- Nurses lack both legal protection for performing abortions and clarity on the law. According to most of the nurses interviewed for this report, the abortion law is not covered in their training. The mistaken belief among a number of those interviewed is that abortion is illegal, with no exception to preserve the woman's life or health.<sup>149</sup> The Nursing Council's Code of Ethics and Professional Conduct for Nurses, under a non-exhaustive catalog of disciplinary offenses, lists "performing or assisting in illegal procedures e.g. procuring abortions" as a malpractice offense.<sup>150</sup> The code mentions no exceptions in which procuring an abortion may be considered legal, contrary to Kenyan law.<sup>151</sup>
- Clinical officers lack training and information on abortion law and practice. Clinical officers are mid-level healthcare providers "who offer a wide range of medical services" and "supplement the work of medical doctors at all levels of healthcare."<sup>152</sup> According to the Clinical Officers Council, which is charged with overseeing clinical officers' training,<sup>153</sup> clinical officers are taught the content of the abortion law.<sup>154</sup> However, as with nurses, the educational focus appears to be primarily on the prohibitive nature of the Penal Code provisions. Clinical officers therefore believe the law only applies to the most extreme and indisputable—and therefore rarest—of circumstances. For example, explained a post-abortion care trainer for clinical officers and nurses, "people understand 'save the woman's life' to be if the woman will die in the next five minutes."<sup>155</sup>
- Doctors, including gynecologists, also remain unclear about legal standards for abortion access. "We didn't talk about the law in university. At university we were taught about post-abortion care but not about termination," a general practitioner trained at Moi University stated.<sup>156</sup> Similarly, a gynecologist trained at the University of Nairobi explained that they were never taught the law in medical school.<sup>157</sup> This fact may explain the incorrect belief of pediatrician and chief administrator at New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, as told to the Center for Reproductive Rights, that "there is no legal termination."<sup>158</sup>
- Lack of familiarity with the law and policies surrounding abortion can result in healthcare providers themselves creating barriers to women's access to safe abortion. Many providers believe that abortion is simply illegal and thus refrain from both offering services and referring women to other providers. Other healthcare providers erroneously believe that the law requires the written approval of gynecologists and psychiatrists—both a rarity in Kenya—to perform a termination, creating additional barriers to access and resulting in few women being able to benefit from a safe and legal abortion in public hospitals. A study carried out in Nairobi by a gynecologist found that all the recorded therapeutic abortion cases he identified had been performed only after obtaining a written recommendation from a psychiatrist.<sup>159</sup>
  - The Medical Board's Code of Conduct however does not contain a gynecologist or psychiatrist consultation requirement. This misinformation can be traced to training schools' curriculums: one of Kenya's two medical schools teaches students to seek

the written opinion of two medical practitioners, "usually a psychiatrist and another doctor"<sup>160</sup> while the nursing school at the University of Nairobi teaches nurses to first find a gynecologist and psychiatrist if a termination is to be considered.<sup>161</sup>

 The absence of policies or protocols specifically addressing abortion, or abortion-related referrals, means that providers have wide latitude to exercise their discretion in service provision. Delaying tactics – or outright denial of services – are not uncommon.<sup>162</sup> A former nurse-manager of the OB/GYN department at Kenyatta National Hospital (KNH) recounted an incident at the hospital:

We had a mentally [disabled] girl who was sick and pregnant. The decision was unanimous that the pregnancy was to be terminated but the doctor that was there that was most senior was anti-choice and said she couldn't do it. [The girl] was almost at full term when we realized that the woman was physically unable to deliver [due to] high blood pressure and pelvic problems and we had to do a hysterotomy [incision of the uterus]. The policies are on paper, but people are the policy. . . . The doctors in charge are supposed to be translating the guidelines and putting them into action but some doctors never do it.<sup>163</sup>

- The limited number of healthcare providers trained to perform abortions also dramatically
  restricts women's access to safe abortion services—and magnifies concerns about provider
  barriers to access, given that few providers are able to offer services. The lack of provider
  training is due primarily to poor government policies that have failed to clarify who may offer
  safe abortion services and under what circumstances, and to ensure that enough providers
  are sufficiently trained in the procedure.
- The limited number of healthcare providers trained in post-abortion care was identified by many of those interviewed for this report as a distinct barrier to women's access to care. Immediate and efficient access to post-abortion care is particularly important because it is an emergency service; as stated in the government's Post-Abortion Care Trainer's Manual, post-abortion care is "often essential to save a woman's life and preserve health."<sup>164</sup> A clinical officer who practices at a district hospital discussed the delays in care caused by a lack of trained staff:

We have insufficient staff and equipment for abortion. We don't want to raise the issue because it would be controversial. . . . We have only ten trained clinical officers and five trained doctors in MVA. There are times when a woman comes in and no one is there who is trained in PAC [post-abortion care].<sup>165</sup>

## CONCLUSION ELEVEN: CRIMINALIZATION OF ABORTION STIGMATIZES AND HARMS MEDICAL PROVIDERS WHO PROVIDE ABORTION-RELATED CARE

#### The context:

- According to the chairman of the Medical Practitioners and Dentists Board [the Board], the statutory body charged with regulating medical and dental practice in Kenya, the Board has inspected and closed many clinics due to reports from members of the public and police of illegal abortions being performed there—in fact, "abortion is the commonest reason to close clinics," said Dr. Kyambi.<sup>166</sup> He explained that the Medical Board has not been able to get "people in the act, but when the public complains we look for another reason to close the clinic."<sup>167</sup> The Medical Board's chief executive officer, explained the process similarly: "[The police and members of the public] report that this is a clinic carrying out abortions, then we get other reasons for closing it."<sup>168</sup>
- Research has revealed that a woman's community or family—more than anyone else is generally responsible for reporting her and the provider to the police for suspected procurement of an illegal abortion.<sup>169</sup>

#### **Research conclusions:**

- Healthcare providers who offer post-abortion care or abortion services are significantly affected by Kenya's restrictive abortion law in both their professional work and their personal lives. Providers and their families encounter police and community harassment, are forced to pay bribes to police, are criminally prosecuted, face employment discrimination due to the stigma surrounding abortion, and struggle with the internal personal and professional tension that the law creates, pitting their duty to save lives and promote health against their obligation to obey the law.
- Healthcare providers have been repeatedly deterred from offering post-abortion care services for fear of community and police harassment. The instruments and supplies for the provision of post-abortion care are often identical to those used in procuring abortions and, as a result, many providers have been accused of performing illegal abortions. Unwilling to face potential criminal charges for being complicit in providing illegal abortions simply because they were offering post-abortion care services to survivors of unsafe abortion, many providers choose not to offer post-abortion care at all.<sup>170</sup>
  - Many providers interviewed for this report recounted personal experiences with police harassment. Such harassment occurs primarily in private clinics or private hospitals and affects nurses, clinical officers, and doctors alike. Harassment may take the form of random police intrusions into health facilities or of targeted interventions resulting from community "tip-offs" or police initiatives—the latter often an effort to carry out personal retaliation or extort money from fearful healthcare providers.
- Con artists also prey on providers. Members of the public are using providers' vulnerability to public scorn as an easy way to make money. Posing as policemen and journalists, these individuals storm a clinic with video cameras while the provider is in the midst of a procedure, and then demand money in exchange for not going public with the footage and arresting the provider. A Nairobi-based doctor was the victim of this scheme in late 2009, when individuals claiming to be police officers from the Central Police Station and journalists from a television station barged into his clinic while he was performing a manual vacuum aspiration (MVA) procedure on a woman. He was forced to pay a 200,000-shilling (\$2,632) bribe to these "policeman" and accompanying "journalists," whose credentials were vague.

#### Conclusion

#### Immediate Steps are Needed to Improve Reproductive Health for Women, Girls, and Families in Kenya

As this report demonstrates, when access to safe and legal abortion is limited, women resort to unsafe abortion, with devastating consequences for their health, lives, and families. This report documents these consequences in Kenya, highlighting how Kenya's restrictive legal and policy regime, coupled with the Kenyan government's failure to effectively address the root causes leading to unwanted pregnancies, leaves women squarely in harm's way.

The report offers a comprehensive look at the corrosive effects of criminalizing abortion. It further demonstrates the toll the law has on the lives of healthcare providers and on their ability to effectively and ethically comply with the dictates of their profession: to save the lives and protect the health of their patients. Finally, the overwhelming resource burden placed on the healthcare system by the number of patients seeking post-abortion care can be traced directly to Kenya's restrictive abortion law.

Reform is needed to address the problem of unsafe abortion and low-quality abortion care. The following section provides recommendations for concrete steps that would dramatically improve—and save—the lives of women and girls in Kenya.

## **HUMAN RIGHTS IMPLICATIONS**

Key Human Rights Treaties and Bodies Affirm the Importance of Safe and Legal Abortion Services and Quality Post-Abortion Care

- The African Charter's Protocol on the Rights of Women in Africa (Maputo Protocol) has affirmed the importance of safe abortion services in cases of sexual violence, threats to the mental and physical health or life of the pregnant women, and serious fetal anomaly. <sup>171</sup>
- International human rights bodies have recognized that the denial of access to safe and legal abortion and post-abortion care violates a range of human rights, including the right to be free from torture and cruel, inhuman, or degrading treatment, and the rights to life and health
  - o For example, the Committee against Torture which oversees compliance with the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment has urged countries which restrict access to voluntary abortion, particularly in cases of rape, to consider creating exceptions to the criminalization of abortion.<sup>172</sup> The Committee has recognized that "prohibitions of abortion . . . even in cases of rape [and] incest" cause mental suffering, entailing "constant exposure to the violation committed against her and causes serious traumatic stress and a risk of long-lasting psychological problems such as anxiety and depression."<sup>173</sup> Further, in the context of post-abortion care, the Committee against Torture has stated in concluding observations that "[i]n accordance with World Health Organization guidelines, the State party should ensure immediate and unconditional treatment of persons seeking emergency medical care."<sup>174</sup>
- When discussing the right to health generally and for adolescents in Kenya, both the Economic, Social and Cultural Rights Committee which oversees state compliance with the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights,<sup>175</sup> and the Children's Rights Committee which oversees state compliance with the Convention on the Rights of the Child,<sup>176</sup> have both expressed concern over Kenya's restrictive abortion laws, particularly the criminalization of abortion in the context of rape and incest, when discussing the right to health and adolescent health in Kenya.<sup>177</sup>
- Regarding the right to life, the Human Rights Committee has made clear that measures to protect the right to life in the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights should include those "taken by the State to help women prevent unwanted pregnancies, and to ensure that they do not have to undergo life-threatening clandestine abortions."<sup>178</sup> The Committee recognizes that illegal and unsafe abortion violates a woman's right to life,<sup>179</sup> and has linked illegal and unsafe abortions to high rates of maternal mortality.<sup>180</sup> In its concluding observations for Kenya, pertaining to the right to life, the Human Rights Committee has expressed "concern about the high maternal mortality rate prevalent in the country, caused, inter alia, by a high number of unsafe or illegal abortions."<sup>181</sup>

#### Recommendations

#### TO THE GOVERNMENT OF KENYA

#### To the Executive Branch

- Publicly acknowledge the importance of reducing unsafe abortion in order to meet Kenya's obligations under the Millennium Development Goals, particularly the goal to reduce maternal mortality.
- Support legislative and policy reform to improve access to safe and legal abortion services and quality post-abortion care services. Emphasize that unsafe abortion should be treated as a public health and human rights crisis, not a criminal issue.

#### To the Ministry of Medical Services and the Ministry of Public Health and Sanitation

- Reduce the number of unwanted pregnancies by improving contraceptive access, including addressing shortcomings in post-abortion care family planning.
  - Ensure that the full range of contraceptive methods is widely and consistently available in all public health facilities.
  - Ensure that providers and adolescents know that adolescents have the right to access contraceptives.
  - Combine post-abortion care services with family planning counseling to improve family planning uptake in government facilities. Ensure that family planning counseling is provided in the same facility as post-abortion care prior to discharge.
- Remove barriers to emergency contraception (EC), a vital tool in preventing unwanted and unplanned pregnancy.
  - Clearly address the denial of EC to adolescents and young women as an issue of discrimination.
  - Ensure widespread dissemination of the Division of Reproductive Health's pamphlet "Emergency Contraception: Healthcare Providers Quick Reference Guide" so that providers are not limiting access to EC on the basis of their personal discretion or beliefs. Ensure that all guidelines, manuals, and protocols are updated to reflect that EC can be used up to 120 hours, not 72 hours, after unprotected sex.
  - In light of the Ministry of Health's National Guidelines on the Medical Management of Rape/Sexual Violence (Sexual Violence Guidelines), insist that all health facilities, regardless of their religious affiliation, provide EC to survivors of sexual violence.
- Remove barriers to seeking post-abortion care services, including by addressing women's fear of legal repercussions and inability to pay.
  - Ensure that women are aware of their the right to quality post-abortion care at all
    public and private healthcare facilities and understand that providers are required to
    offer these services under the law. Ensure that women understand the importance of
    seeking care early and immediately to avoid greater complications.

- Consider making post-abortion care a free service. In the interim, standardize postabortion care fees across public health facilities and ensure that this fee structure is public and transparent to all, including by placing the fee on any governmentsponsored signs listing fees that are posted at healthcare facilities.
- Publicize and raise awareness through community outreach that the post-abortion care fee can be waived for women who cannot afford it.
- Remedy equipment and staffing problems that impair the provision of safe abortion and postabortion care services.
  - Ensure that all public health facilities have the necessary supplies to provide these services, including sufficient blood supplies and necessary equipment such as gloves, soap, sterilization equipment, functioning and appropriate manual vacuum aspiration (MVA) kits, and misoprostol.
  - Fulfill the government's commitment to ensure that all hospitals, maternities, and health centers have 24-hour services and providers on site who can provide emergency post-abortion care.
- Develop and disseminate appropriate guidelines to ensure the provision of quality safe abortion services and post-abortion care.
  - When training on the Sexual Violence Guidelines, include a reference to the guidelines' statement that abortion is an option in cases of rape. Develop implementation guidelines for this provision so providers can appropriately care for women who seek to terminate a pregnancy following rape.
  - Ensure effective dissemination and implementation of the Ministry of Health's Essential Obstetric Care Manual, which has clear abortion and post-abortion care guidelines for providers.
  - Summarize the government's Post-Abortion Care Trainer's Manual into concise and accessible guidelines.
    - Rewrite the section on the law in the manual to clarify the scope and content of the law and policies regarding abortion and the policies governing post-abortion care.
    - Revise the section on pain management to ensure that healthcare providers better understand how to manage pain during the provision of post-abortion care.
  - Ensure development and endorsement of safe abortion guidelines. Ensure dissemination and training on these guidelines.
  - Ensure widespread dissemination and awareness-raising on the Ministry of Health's new policy, clearly evidenced in the Ministry's new National Reproductive Health Curriculum for Service Providers, that allows nurses to be trained in post-abortion care.
  - Ensure the creation and dissemination of a clear referral policy that applies to both public and private/mission healthcare facilities and that covers:
    - Denials of access to legal abortion.
    - Denials of access to contraceptives/EC.
- Address training gaps around abortion and post-abortion care.
  - Ensure consistent and widespread comprehensive abortion care training for all providers, including by monitoring training gaps and actively partnering with trainer NGOs to fill in these gaps.

- Ensure that providers are kept abreast of, and trained on, newer and safer technologies in the area of abortion care, such as the use of misoprostol.
- In order to ensure efficient referrals, train community health workers to conduct outreach about the existence and location of post-abortion care.
- Improve accuracy and availability of data on abortion and post-abortion care to ensure an accurate assessment of, and response to, the scope of the problem of unsafe abortion.
  - Address providers' fear of reporting accurate abortion-related data by sensitizing Ministry of Health data collectors on the importance of abortion services and of accurate data. Sanction employees who intimidate or harass providers.
  - Ensure that providers who report data accurately receive the necessary additional equipment and supplies for post-abortion care.
  - Address women's fears concerning the use of this data by protecting confidentiality and collecting data in a way that contains no identifying information that could trace the record back to a particular woman.

#### To the National Council for Population and Development and Relevant Ministries

- Improve post-abortion care-related indicators or measurements in the Kenya Service Provision Assessment Survey.
- Include questions on the effects of, and response to, unwanted and unplanned pregnancies in the Kenya Demographic and Health Survey.

#### To the Ministry of Education

- Reduce unwanted and unplanned pregnancies by improving access to quality sexuality education.
  - Ensure effective implementation of the Ministry of Education's newly created sexuality education curriculum.
  - Disseminate to schools and teachers the United Nations (UN) Education, Scientific and Cultural Organization's (UNESCO) newly-issued International Technical Guidance on Sexuality Education: An evidence-informed approach for schools, teachers, and health educators to assist with teaching this subject. (The guidelines, produced by UNESCO in collaboration with the World Health Organization and the UN Children's Fund, among others, are designed, in part, to reduce the need for abortion through sexuality education.)
- Eliminate discrimination against pregnant schoolgirls and ensure that girls are protected from sexual violence and coercion in educational institutions. With respect to the Ministry's Return to School Policy,
  - Include an explicit provision prohibiting girls from being expelled from school for having procured an abortion.
  - Ensure that educators are aware of the policy and that it includes girls who have had abortions. Ensure that those who do not comply with the policy face appropriate sanctions.
- Revise public school educational texts to ensure accurate and evidence-based discussions of reproductive and sexual health. For example, revise the Kenya Certification Secondary Education Social Education & Ethics Exam Review Book, which provides inaccurate and biased information concerning abortion.

#### To the Ministry of Justice

- Issue a statement that post-abortion care is a legal service and that women seeking postabortion care will not be arrested or prosecuted under any circumstances.
- Issue a statement, reiterating the Attorney General's position in 1977, that the law on abortion in Kenya incorporates the Commonwealth precedent of Rex v. Bourne and therefore includes an exception to preserve the woman's life, which includes preserving her mental or physical health.
- Review existing abortion legislation to ensure that it conforms with Kenya's human rights obligations. Recommend that Parliament remove abortion from the penal code entirely or, at a minimum, to harmonize the law with existing regulations and policies, recommend that Parliament amend the law to introduce explicit exceptions to the legal prohibition, including access to legal abortion in cases of sexual violence and where the physical and mental health of the pregnant woman is threatened.

#### To the Attorney General's Office

- Systematically collect and analyze data on the number of abortion-related cases prosecuted in Kenyan courts, their outcomes, and the characteristics of those prosecuted.
- Clarify that post-abortion care is a legal service and that women will not be prosecuted for receiving or seeking post-abortion care under any circumstances.

#### To the Kenyan Parliament and Appropriate Ministries

- o Strengthen Kenya's human rights framework.
  - Create a constitutional framework that recognizes key human rights, such as the right to health and healthcare services.
  - Remove abortion from the penal code entirely or, at a minimum, to harmonize the law with existing regulations and policies, amend the law to introduce explicit exceptions to the legal prohibition, including access to legal abortion in cases of sexual violence and where the physical and mental health of the pregnant woman is threatened.
  - Ratify and domesticate the African Charter's Protocol on the Rights of Women in Africa (Maputo Protocol).
  - Domesticate other international conventions already ratified by Kenya, including the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.

#### To the Police Administration

- Sensitize officers on the abortion law and emphasize that post-abortion care is a legal service. Train officers to protect, rather than harass, healthcare providers who offer legitimate services. Ensure that women are not harassed or arrested for obtaining abortions or seeking postabortion care.
- o Investigate cases of police impersonators harassing healthcare providers.

#### TO THE KENYA NATIONAL COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS

- Inform and educate the public about reproductive rights, including the right to safe and legal abortion. Publicize treaty monitoring bodies' concluding observations for Kenya pertaining to abortion and post-abortion care.
- Recommend to the government that, in conformity with international human rights law and to harmonize the law with existing regulations and policies, it reform the abortion law to, at a minimum, include explicit exceptions for the preservation of a woman's mental and physical health and for rape and incest.
- Investigate violations of reproductive rights in healthcare facilities, including denial of access to safe and legal abortion, forced sterilization during post-abortion care, and cruel, inhuman, and degrading treatment in the context of procuring an abortion and obtaining postabortion care.

#### **TO ALL PUBLIC AND PRIVATE HEALTHCARE FACILITIES**

- Remove financial barriers and reduce fears of legal repercussions for women seeking postabortion care services.
  - Raise awareness among providers and women that post-abortion care is a legal service. Ensure that signs are clearly posted in facilities stating that post-abortion care is a legal service.
  - Ensure fair and transparent payment policies. Include post-abortion care on the list of services and fees placed outside or inside entrances to public and private hospitals.
  - Publicize the fact that the fee for post-abortion care can be waived for women who cannot afford it.
- Ensure that quality abortion and post-abortion care services are available.
  - Ensure that protocols and procedures are in place for the provision of safe abortion and post-abortion care, including pain management, and for timely referrals in cases of provider refusals to provide a legal service.
  - Ensure an adequate supply of MVA kits, by including these kits in annual procurement orders and budgets, and that supplies for sterilizing MVA kits are procured and available.
  - Ensure that providers trained to provide abortion and post-abortion care services are on duty 24 hours a day.
  - Ensure coordinated staff transfers so there are always a core set of qualified people capable of offering abortion and post-abortion care services on staff in each facility.
  - Ensure the presence in each facility of healthcare providers who are trained to provide abortion-related care for second-trimester pregnancies.
- o Protect the rights of patients seeking abortion-related services.
  - Eliminate the practice of detaining patients who cannot pay. This practice is in violation of Kenyan law, the Medical Practitioners and Dentists Board's (Medical Board) Code of Professional Conduct and Discipline (Code of Conduct), and human rights.

- Create effective and formal complaint mechanisms to ensure that patients have redress for violations of their rights in the context of healthcare delivery.
- Ensure that these mechanisms provide effective accountability and remedies for, among other things, verbal abuse in the context of service delivery, delaying tactics in the provision of legal abortion, denials of legal abortion, and demanding bribes to perform a lawful, emergency service such as post-abortion care.
- Establish official rules for confidential and non-biased investigations and initiate disciplinary action against providers who commit abuses, such as those listed above.
- Ensure that patients are aware of both internal complaint mechanisms and the fact that they have recourse to the Medical Board, Clinical Officers Council, and Nursing Council.

#### TO BODIES OVERSEEING OR REGULATING HEALTHCARE PROFESSIONALS IN KENYA

#### All bodies

- Strengthen curricula and training on safe abortion and abortion-related services to ensure the provision of quality care.
  - Explain the legal and regulatory framework on abortion in Kenya, including the exceptions contained in the Penal Code, the Sexual Violence Guidelines, and the interpretation contained in the Medical Board's Code of Conduct.
    - Highlight providers' ethical obligations to provide emergency contraception and emergency post-abortion care and to refer patients to a qualified provider if they are unable to offer abortion or post-abortion care.
- o Eliminate violations of the rights of women seeking abortion-related services.
  - Sensitize providers and make clear that mistreatment of patients, including verbal abuse, inadequate pain management, and demanding bribes in return for services, is unacceptable and subject to disciplinary action. Investigate and sanction providers who mistreat patients.
  - Investigate and sanction providers who do not offer services or properly refer patients who seek abortion services as permitted under the law.

#### Nursing Council

- Clarify nurses' role in providing abortion-related services and provide the appropriate training to fulfill this role.
  - Clearly define nurses' scope of practice to include post-abortion care and abortion.
  - Revise the Code of Conduct and Professional Conduct for Nurses to explain that abortion is not wholly prohibited and explicitly include the exceptions that are permitted based on the legal, policy, and regulatory framework. Revise or delete the misleading abortion language under the malpractice column in the list of punishable offenses in the Code of Conduct.
  - Ensure training of the staff and students at the nursing school in Manual Vacuum Aspiration (MVA).
- Issue an authoritative interpretation of the abortion law for nurses, similar to the Medical Board's, that provides guidance for nurses in performing terminations of pregnancies within the scope of the law.

#### **Clinical Officers Council**

- Clarify clinical officers' role in providing abortion-related services and provide the appropriate training to fulfill this role.
  - Clearly define the clinical officers' scope of practice to include post-abortion care and abortion and post-abortion family planning counseling.
  - Ensure that clinical officers have hands-on training in providing abortion-related services, including using MVA, dilation and extraction, and misoprostol.
- Issue an interpretation of the abortion law, similar to the Medical Board's, that provides guidance for clinical officers in performing terminations of pregnancies within the scope of the law.
  - Revise the provision on termination of pregnancy in the Code of Professional Conduct for Clinical Officers, which now simply states that termination is not available "on demand," to include a positive statement about when abortion is permitted under the law and when performing the procedure will not subject a provider to disciplinary measures.

#### Medical Practitioners and Dentists Board

- Clarify and amend the Code of Conduct provision on termination of pregnancy to ensure greater access to safe abortion services.
  - Replace the language recommending that the procedure be performed in a hospital with less restrictive language stating that the procedure may be performed at a wider range of qualified healthcare facilities.
  - Replace language implying that the procedure should ideally be performed by a gynecologist with language stating that the procedure can be performed by a "qualified healthcare provider."
  - Make explicit that "health" as mentioned in the provision includes both mental and physical health.
  - Remove the recommendation for consultation with two "senior" colleagues; this unnecessary limitation creates barriers to access given the short supply of doctors in Kenya.
- Amend the Code of Conduct to introduce disciplinary rules to explicitly address the denial of legal medical care and the obligation to refer in those circumstances.
- Streamline the processes for hearing complaints against providers so that they may be heard in a more timely fashion. Make a point to take cases pertaining to delays/denials or abuses in the provision of medically indicated care, namely legal abortion.

#### TO MEDICAL SCHOOLS, CLINICAL OFFICER TRAINING SCHOOLS, AND NURSING SCHOOLS

- Train students to provide respectful, quality post-abortion care, and safe and legal abortions under the existing law and policies.
  - Ensure that comprehensive post-abortion care and abortion training is an explicitly articulated requirement in each school's curriculum, including informed and nondirective abortion-related counseling, and practical hands-on MVA experience.

- Ensure accurate and comprehensive training on the legal, policy, and regulatory framework surrounding abortion and post-abortion care.
- Ensure training on pain management and misoprostol use for abortion and postabortion care.
- Ensure wider training on terminating pregnancies and treating abortion-related complications in the second trimester of pregnancy.

#### TO ASSOCIATIONS OF HEALTHCARE PROFESSIONALS IN KENYA

- Advocate for increased training and education on abortion and post-abortion care for in-service professionals.
- Consider holding education and values clarification workshops on the toll and causes of unsafe abortion with association members.

#### TO THE AFRICAN UNION COMMISSIONER FOR SOCIAL AFFAIRS

• Urge the Kenyan government to allocate 15% of government expenditure to the health sector, in accordance with the Abuja Declaration of African governments.

#### TO UN AND AFRICAN COMMISSION SPECIAL RAPPORTEURS

- Continue speaking out against violations of reproductive rights as fundamental human rights violations, including lack of access to safe and legal abortion. Continue exposing how other human rights violations, such as sexual violence, contribute to unwanted pregnancy.
- Promote respect for reproductive rights defenders by highlighting the importance of their work globally, including in Kenya.

## TO UN TREATY MONITORING BODIES AND THE AFRICAN COMMISSION ON HUMAN AND PEOPLES' RIGHTS

- Use Kenya's periodic reporting to issue strong concluding observations and recommendations in order to reinforce Kenya's obligation to protect the rights of women seeking reproductive healthcare services, including safe abortion and quality post-abortion care services, and to provide redress and remedies for violations of these rights.
- Encourage the ratification and implementation of key regional and human rights treaties that protect reproductive rights, including the right to safe and legal abortion services.

#### TO THE INTERNATIONAL DONOR COMMUNITY

• Support advocacy efforts to protect women's reproductive rights, including efforts to improve access to safe and legal abortion services and quality post-abortion care. Support initiatives to

document and seek redress for reproductive rights violations.

- Assist the Kenyan government with establishing mechanisms for preventing and monitoring abuses in the provision of reproductive healthcare, including abortion and post-abortion care services.
- o Increase funding for post-abortion care programs, including training and equipment purchasing.

#### TO UNITED STATES STATE DEPARTMENT AND OFFICE OF GLOBAL WOMEN'S ISSUES, AND THE UNITED STATES AGENCY FOR INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT (USAID)

- Include information on unsafe abortion and access to post-abortion care in the State Department's Country Reports on Human Rights.
- Continue disseminating information about the fact that the Mexico City Policy (which restricted organizations receiving USAID funding from advocating for access to abortion) has been rescinded. Support efforts to strengthen information exchange, capacity building, and the technical capacity necessary to implement the repeal of the Mexico City Policy.
- Take steps to mitigate the harms caused by the Mexico City Policy by increasing funding to strengthen local capacity to provide reproductive health services and information to women, and to advocate for reproductive rights, including the right to safe abortion.

#### Endnotes

- Ipas, Abortion and Human Rights in Sub-saharan Africa, 3(2) Initiatives in Reproductive Health Policy (July 2000).
- Ipas, A National Assessment of the Magnitude and Consequences of Unsafe Abortion in Kenva 22 (2004).
- 3 World Health Organization, Unsafe abortion: new estimates, Progress, No. 76 (2008) 7 available at http://www.who.int/hrp/ Progress76.pdf.
- Central Bureau of Statistics, 2003 Kenya Demographic and Health Survey 110 (2004) [hereinafter 2003 KDHS].
- 5 Kenya National Bureau of Statistics et al., 2008-2009 Kenya Demographic and Health Survey: Preliminary Report 14 (June 2009).
- Central Bureau of Statistics, 2003 Kenya Demographic and Health Survey 106 (2004) [hereinafter 2003 KDHS].
- Failure to Deliver at 18; Joyce Mulama, Contraceptives: Stock-outs Threaten Family Planning, Inter Press Service (Latin America), May 18, 2009; see also National Coordinating Agency for Population and Development, the Ministry of Health, and the Central Bureau of Statistics, The 2004 Kenya Service Provision Assessment Survey-Family Planning Key Findings available at www.measuredhs.com/pubs/pdf/SR176/ SR176.pdf (last visited Feb. 4, 2010) 5.
- 8 2003 KDHS at 82.
- 2003 KDHS at 84..
- 10 National Coordinating Agency for Population and Development, the Ministry of Health, and the Central Bureau of Statistics, The 2004 Kenya Service Provision Assessment Survey—Family Planning Key Findings available at www.measuredhs.com/pubs/pdf/ SR176/SR176.pdf (last visited Feb. 4, 2010) 9
- 11 Joyce Mulama, Contraceptives: Stock-outs Threaten Family Planning, Inter Press Service (Latin America). May 18, 2009.
- 12 Susan Anyangu, Nyong'o Decries Limited Access to Contraceptives, The Standard, Aug. 4, 2009
- 13 ld.
- 14 Centre for the Study of Adolescence, Down the Drain: Counting the Costs of Teenage Pregnancy and School Drop Out in Kenya 28 (2008).
- 15 Central Bureau of Statistics, 2003 Kenya Demographic and Health Survey 95, Table 6.5 (2004).
- 16 Centre for the Study of Adolescence, Down the Drain: Counting the Costs of Teenage Pregnancy and School Drop Out in Kenya 31 (2008)
- 17 Susan Anyangu, Practical Measures Needed on Teen Sexual Education, Inter Press Service, Oct. 27, 2009, available at http:// allafrica.com/stories/200910271243.html (last visited Feb. 4, 2010) ("At St Georges, a public school, aside from a project funded by a non-governmental organisation, there is no sexual education on the curriculum."). 18 ld.

- 19 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009. 20
- Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- 21 2003 KDHS at 62.
- 22 Centre for the Study of Adolescence, Down the Drain: Counting the Costs of Teenage Pregnancy and School Drop Out in Kenya 28 (2008). 23
  - ld.
- 24 Kwamboka Oyaro, Teenage Mothers Denied Education, Inter Press Service, May 23, 2008, available at http://ipsnews.net/africa/ nota.asp?idnews=42487 (last visited Feb. 5, 2010). See also Centre for the Study of Adolescence, Down the Drain: Counting the Costs of Teenage Pregnancy and School Drop Out in Kenya 8 (2008).
- 25 Centre for the Study of Adolescence, Down the Drain: Counting the Costs of Teenage Pregnancy and School Drop Out in Kenya 11 (2008) (citing to the Central Bureau of Statistics. Economic Survey 2007).
- 26 Kwamboka Oyaro, Teenage Mothers Denied Education, Inter Press Service, May 23, 2008, available at http://ipsnews.net/africa/ nota.asp?idnews=42487 (last visited Feb. 5, 2010).
- 27 Centre for the Study of Adolescence, Down the Drain: Counting the Costs of Teenage Pregnancy and School Drop Out in Kenya 46-47 (2008).
- 28 Id. at 48. Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 9, 2009
- 29 Id
- 30 Peter Mutai, Lone Girl in Class After 24 Pregnant Students Drop Out, The Standard, Mar. 9, 2009, available at http:// www.eastandard.net/news/InsidePage. php?id=1144023081&cid=4& (last visited Feb. 5, 2010).
- 31 Anthony Kitimo, Pregnancy Causes 28 to Drop Out of School, Daily Nation, Oct. 6, 2009; Anthony Kitimo, Probe Order as 28 Girls Quit School, Daily Nation, Oct. 6, 2009.
- 32 Focus group discussion with unnamed participants, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- 33 Focus group discussion with unnamed participants, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- 34 Id. (citing Okumu et al., 1994 and Murray et al., 2003)
- 35 Top KCPE Pupil Dies after Abortion, East African Standard, Jan. 6, 2005.
- 36 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Gembe, July 7, 2009.
- 37 Tony Johnston, Population Communication Africa, The Sexual Abuse of Kenyan Women and Girls: A Briefing Book 6, 14 (2003). 38
- 2003 KDHS at 244. 39
- Michelle J. Hinden et al., Intimate Partner Violence Among Couples in 10 DHS Countries: Predictors and Health Outcomes xi (United States Agency for International Development, 2008).
- 40 Id. at 63.
- 41 Id. at 62 and Table 4.2 (United States Agency for International Development, 2008)
- 42 Joy Wanja, Teenage Sex Study Shock for Parents, Daily Nation, Oct. 13, 2009.

- Commission of Inquiry into the Post Election Violence, Final Report (CIPEV) at 265 (Oct. 15, 2008) available at http:// www.communication.go.ke/Documents/ CIPEV\_FINAL\_REPORT.pdf (last visited Feb. 4, 2010).
- 44 Women's Commission for Refugee Women and Children, Reproductive Health Coordination Gap, Services Ad hoc: Minimum Initial Service Package (MISP) Assessment in Kenya 14 (2008).
- 45 A "majority of urban Kenyans" live in slumlike conditions in informal settlements. The Centre on Housing Rights and Evictions, Kenya: Right to Housing and Water, Article 11(1) at 2 (2007). Over 222,000 Kenyans are considered to be "internally displaced persons," residing in makeshift and often unsafe camps, unable to return to their homes due to violence or other factors. United States Agency for International Development, Kenya: Complex Emergency Fact Sheet #2 (FY 2008) at 1 (2008).
- Centre for the Study of Adolescence, Down the Drain: Counting the Costs of Teenage Pregnancy and School Drop Out in Kenya 31 (2008).
- 47 Division of Reproductive Health, Ministry of Health (Kenya), Medical Management of Rape/Sexual Violence Guidelines, at 2 (1st ed. 2004) available at http://www.drh.go.ke/ documents/Guidelines\_gender.pdf (last visited Jan. 26, 2010).
- 48 Division of Reproductive Health, Ministry of Health (Kenya), Emergency Contraception: Health Care Providers Quick Reference Guide (2008) 3.
- 49 Division of Reproductive Health, Ministry of Health (Kenya), Emergency Contraception: Health Care Providers Quick Reference Guide (2008) 4.
- 50 Division of Reproductive Health, Ministry of Health (Kenya), Medical Management of Rape/Sexual Violence Guidelines, at 2 (1st ed. 2004) available at http://www.drh.go.ke/ documents/Guidelines\_gender.pdf (last visited Feb. 4, 2010).
- 51 See World Health Organization (WHO), Family Planning: A Global Handbook for Providers 45, 49 (2007), available at http:// info.k4health.org/globalhandbook/handbook. pdf (last visited Feb. 4, 2010). See also WHO, Fact sheet No. 244: Emergency Contraception (October 2005), available at http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/ fs244/en/index.html (last visited Feb. 4, 2010).
- 52 Division of Reproductive Health, Ministry of Health (Kenya), Emergency Contraception: Health Care Providers Quick Reference Guide (2008) 4.
- 53 Interview with Damarice Otieno, Nurse, Suba District Hospital & private practice, Sindo, July 9, 2009; interview with Sylverns Ater Kagose, Nurse Manager, Suba District Hospital, Sindo, July 8, 2009; interview with Louis Machogu, Programs Pharmacists, Family Health Options Kenya, Nairobi, July 1, 2009; interview with Stephen Kimatu, Head, Medicines Information Department,

Pharamcy and Poisons Board, Nariobi, July 20, 2009; interview with Sarah Abuyeka, Nursing Officer, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 28, 2009.

- 54 Division of Reproductive Health, Ministry of Health (Kenya), Emergency Contraception: Health Care Providers Quick Reference Guide (2008) 3.
- 55 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- 56 Interview with Louis Machogu, Programs Pharmacists, Family Health Options Kenya, Nairobi, July 1, 2009.
- 57 The Penal Code § 159, Cap. 63..
- 58 The Penal Code, § 158, Cap. 63.
- 59 The Penal Code, § 160, Cap. 63.. 60 The Penal Code, § 240 (stating that "A person is not criminally responsible for performing in good faith and with reasonable care and skill a surgical operation upon any person for his benefit, or upon an unborn child for the preservation of the mother's life, if the performance of the operation is reasonable, having regard to the patient's state at the time and to all the circumstances of the case.").
- Interview with Dr. Chris Wagaiyu, Chair, and 61 Stella Mwihaki, Legal Advisor-Kenya Medical Practitioners and Dentists Board, Nairobi, Mar. 13, 2007; see Failure to Deliver at at 70
- 62 Interview with Faith Mbehero, Program Officer, National Nurses Association of Kenya, Tsavo, June 24, 2009...
- 63 Id.; focus group discussion with unnamed participants, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009.
- 64 Interview with Faith Mbehero, Program Officer, National Nurses Association of Kenya, Tsavo, June 24, 2009.
- 65 Interview with Emmaculate, Community Organizer in Kibera, Nairobi, June 30, 2009.
- 66 Interview with Grace, Dandora Phase I, July 14, 2009; interview with Christine Ong'ete, Reproductive Health Coordinator for Suba District, Mbita, July 6, 2009.
- 67 Interview with Nurse/Administrator, Maternity Hospital, Nairobi, Nov. 16, 2006 (name withheld); interview with Christine Ong'ete, Reproductive Health Coordinator for Suba District, Mbita, July 6, 2009.
- 68 Focus group discussion with unnamed participants, Gembe, July 7, 2009; focus group discussion with unnamed participants, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009.
- 69 Focus group discussion with unnamed participants, Gembe, July 7, 2009; focus group discussion with unnamed participants, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009.
- Interview with Nurse-Midwife/Clinic Owner, Private Clinic, Dandora Phase I, July 3, 2009 (name withheld); focus group discussion with unnamed participants, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009.
- 71 Interview with Nurse-Midwife/Clinic Owner, Private Clinic, Dandora Phase I, July 3, 2009 (name withheld); interview with Sarah Abuyeka, Nursing Officer, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 28, 2009.

- 72 Interview with Faith Mbehero, Program Officer, National Nurses Association of Kenya, Tsavo, June 24, 2009.
- Interview with Sarah Abuyeka, Nursing 73 Officer, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 28, 2009.
- 74 Interview with Dr. Willis Badia, Obstetrician-Gynecologist Consultant, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 9, 2009.
- 75 Interview with Rape Trauma Counselor, Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, October 30, 2009 (name withheld).
- Interview with Carol Waiganjo, Program 76 Officer, Coalition on Violence Against Women, Nairobi, October 28, 2009.
- 77 Interview with Rape Trauma Counselor, Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, October 30, 2009 (name withheld).
- 78 Interview with official with close ties to the Medical Board, Nairobi, July 1, 2009 (name withheld).
- 79 Interview with Emmaculate, Community Organizer in Kibera, Nairobi, June 30, 2009. 80
- Interview with reproductive rights researcher, Nairobi, Nov. 5, 2009 (name withheld).
- 81 Interview with reproductive rights researcher, Nairobi, Nov. 5, 2009 (name withheld).
- 82 *Id.*; email correspondence with reproductive rights researcher, Jan. 7, 2010 (name withheld).
- 83 Interview with reproductive rights researcher, Nairobi, Nov. 5, 2009 (name withheld).
- 84 Interview with Evelyne, Kibera, July 11, 2009
- 85 Rebecca Cook and Bernard Dickens, Abortion Laws in African Commonwealth Countries, 25(2) Journal of African Law, (1981) at 61.
- 86 Institute of Economic Affairs - Kenya, Profile of Women's Socio-economic Status in Kenya at 18-19 (2008), available at http://www. ieakenya.or.ke/documents/Profiling%20 Women%20in%20Kenya.pdf (last visited February 2, 2010) ..
- United Nations Development Program, Human Development Report 2009 Data: Kenya, available at http://hdrstats.undp.org/ en/buildtables/rc\_report.cfm (last visited February 2, 2010).
- 88 Interview with Nurse-Midwife/Clinic Owner. Private Clinic, Dandora Phase I, July 3, 2009 (name withheld)...
- 89 Interview with Nurse, Nyalenda, Kisumu, July 9, 2009 (name withheld).
- 90 Interview with Clinical Officer, Private Clinic, Dandora Phase I, July 3, 2009 (name withheld). 91
- Id. at §1, 37 (2003).
- 92 Id. at §1, 37 (2003)...
- 93 Ministry of Health (Kenya), Essential Obstetric Care Manual (Third ed. 2006), at 68-79.
- 94 National Joint Steering Committee for Maternal Health (Kenya) (Coordinators: Kenya Obstetrician and Gynecologists Society and National Nurses Association of Kenya), Standards for Maternal Care in Kenya at 27 (2002) available at http://www.drh.go.ke/ documents/STDs%20for%20maternal%20 care.pdf (last visited Jan. 29, 2010) ...

- 95 Interview with Nurse/Administrator, Maternity Hospital, Nairobi, June 20, 2009 (name withheld).
- 96 Interview with Damarice Otieno, Nurse, Suba District Hospital & private practice, Sindo, July 8, 2009.
- 97 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009.
- 98 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009.
- 99 Interview with Nurse-Midwife/Clinic Owner. Private Clinic, Dandora Phase I, July 3, 2009 (name withheld).
- 100 Interview with Dr. Stephen Ochiel, Obstetrician-Gynecologist, University of Nairobi, June 19, 2009.
- 101 Interview with Dr. Aggrey Otieno Akula, Medical Superintendent, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- 102 Interview with Francisca Bahati, Kenya Registered Community Health Nurse and Family Planning, Coast Provincial General Hospital, Mombasa, Aug. 3, 2009; interview with Dr. Jennifer Othigo, Reproductive Health Advisor for Coast Province, Division of Reproductive Health, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009; interview with Damarice Otieno, Nurse, Suba District Hospital, Sindo, July 8, 2009; interview with Sarah Abuyeka, Nursing Officer, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 28, 2009; interview with Dr. Aggrey Otieno Akula, Medical Superintendent, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009; interview with Dr. Mitei, Obstetrician-Gynecologist Consultant, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 28, 2009.
- 103 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- 104 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009.
- 105 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009.
- 106 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- 107 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Gembe, July 7, 2009.
- 108 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Gembe, July 7, 2009.
- 109 Edmund Sander, In Kenya, patients held hostage to medical bills, Los Angeles Times, June 27, 2009, available at http://articles. latimes.com/2009/jun/28/world/fg-kenyahealthcare28.
- 110 2004 KSPAS at Table A-6.43.1, 294 (Nov. 2005).
- 111 Id. at Appendix B, Table A-6.43.2, 295.
- Id. at Appendix B, Table A-7.5, 301.
- 113 Ministry of Health (Kenya) (Division of Reproductive Health). Kenva National Reproductive Health Curriculum for Service Providers (2006).
- 114 Id. at foreword, ix.
- 115 MOH Post Abortion Care Trainer's Manual at §1, 27 (2003).
- 116 Dr. Zahida Qureshi, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, Aug. 10, 2009.

- <sup>116</sup> Dr. Zahida Qureshi, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, Aug. 10, 2009.
- <sup>118</sup> National Coordinating Agency for Population and Development (NCAPD) (Kenya), Ministry of Health, Central Bureau of Statistics, *Kenya Service Provision Assessment Survey 2004*, at 13, *available at* www.measuredhs.com/ pubs/pdf/SPA8/02Chapter2.pdf (last visited Feb. 15, 2010) [hereinafter 2004 KSPAS]. <sup>119</sup> *Id.*at 21.
- <sup>120</sup> Central Intelligence Agency, The World Factbook: Kenya, available at https://www. cia.gov/library/publications/the-worldfactbook/geos/ke.html (last visited Jan. 28, 2010).
- 121 Neeru Gupta et al., Uses of population census data for monitoring geographical imbalance in the health workforce: snapshots from three developing countries, 2(11) International Journal for Equity in Health (2003). Citing a study looking at the inequality of the spatial distribution of health workers found that distribution inequalities of health workers were not only high in Kenya, but highest among health professionals (Gini coefficient of 0.497), then nursing/midwifery personnel (0.277) and finally other health associate professionals (0.263). The Gini coefficient is a mathematical measure of inequality in income or wealth.
- <sup>122</sup> Interview with Consultant Obstetrician and Gynecologist, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 28, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>123</sup> Interview with Micah K. Kisoo, Registrar, Clinical Officers Council and Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, and Manaseh Bocha, Deputy Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, Nairobi, July 22, 2009; see also 2004 KSPAS at 112.
- <sup>124</sup> Interview with Professor Julius Kyambi, Chairman, Medical Practitioners and Dentists Board, Nairobi, July 13, 2009.
- <sup>125</sup> Interview with Daniel Yumbya, Chief Executive Officer, Medical Practitioners and Dentists Board, Nairobi, July 1, 2009; interview with Professor Julius Kyambi, Chairman, Medical Practitioners and Dentists Board, Nairobi, July 13, 2009.
- <sup>126</sup> World Health Organization, Mid-level health-care providers are a safe alternative to doctors for first-trimester abortions in developing countries [WHO/RHR/ HRP/08.15] (2008), available at http://www. who.int/reproductivehealth/publications/ unsafe\_abortion/rhr\_hrp\_08\_15/en/index. html (last visited Jan. 28, 2010).
- <sup>127</sup> Interview with Dr. Margaret Meme, Program Manager, Gender and Reproductive Rights and Dr. Annie Gituto, Program Officer, Maternal Newborn Health, Division of Reproductive Health, Ministry of Health, Nairobi, Aug. 6, 2009.
- <sup>128</sup> Interview with Dr. Willis Badia, Obstetrician and Gynecologist, Private Practitioner and Consultant at New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 9, 2009; interview with Doctor, not-for-profit private clinic,

Kisumu, July 9, 2009 (name withheld); interview with Dr. Boaz Nyunya, Professor of OB/GYN, Moi University, Nairobi, June 29, 2009; interview with Sylverns Ater Kagose, Nurse Manager, Suba District Hospital, Sindo, July 8, 2009; interview with Consultant Obstetrician and Gynecologist, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 28, 2009 (name withheld).

- <sup>129</sup> Interview with Dr. John Nyamu, Gynecologist with private practice in Nairobi, June 30, 2009.
- <sup>130</sup> Interview with Dr. Boaz Nyunya, Professor of OB/GYN, Moi University, Nairobi, June 29, 2009.
- <sup>131</sup> Interview with Dr. Grace Omoni, Senior Lecturer in Obstetrics and Midwifery, Dr. Blasio Omuga, Lecturer in Obstetrics and Midwifery and Obstetrician and Gynecologist, Mrs. Margaret Mwiva, Senior Lecturer in Medical/Surgical Nursing, Mrs. Theresa Odero, Acting Director of the School of Nursing, School of Nursing, Nairobi, Aug. 5, 2009.
- <sup>132</sup> Statistic provided by Administrative Assistant, Medical Practitioners and Dentists Board, Nairobi, Nov. 2, 2009.
- <sup>133</sup> Frank Njenga, *Focus on psychiatry in East Africa*, (181) The British Journal of Psychiatry, 354-359 (2002), *available at* http://bjp.rcpsych.org/cgi/content/full/181/4/354 (last visited Jan. 28, 2010).
- <sup>134</sup> MOH Post Abortion Care Trainer's Manual at xvii.
- <sup>135</sup> *Id.* at §1, 24.
- <sup>136</sup> *Id.* at §§1,33 and 1,36.
- <sup>137</sup> *Id.* at §1,36.
- <sup>138</sup> *Id.* at §1,36
- <sup>139</sup> Interview with Nurse, Nyalenda, Kisumu, July 9, 2009 (name withheld); interview with Nurse, Mbita, July 6, 2009 (name withheld); interview with Nurse, Mbita, July 6, 2009 (name withheld); interview with Sarah Abuyeka, Nursing Officer, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 28, 2009.
- <sup>140</sup> Interview with Francisca Bahati, Kenya Registered Community Health Nurse and Family Planning, Coast Provincial General Hospital, Mombasa, Aug. 3, 2009.
- <sup>141</sup> The Nurses Act, § 9(1)(d), Cap. 257 of the Laws of Kenya, (Revised ed. 1985).
- Interview with David Wambuku and Frederick Ochieno, Educational Officers in the Education Department, Nursing Council of Kenya, Nairobi, July 20, 2009.
   Id
- <sup>144</sup> Id.
- <sup>145</sup> Nursing Council of Kenya, Code of Ethics and Professional Conduct for Nurses at 21 (Mar. 2006).
- <sup>146</sup> See Id.
- <sup>147</sup> Interview with Dr. Grace Omoni, Senior Lecturer in Obstetrics and Midwifery, Dr. Blasio Omuga, Lecturer in Obstetrics and Midwifery and Obstetrician and Gynecologist, Mrs. Margaret Mwiva, Senior Lecturer in Medical/Surgical Nursing, Mrs. Theresa Odero, Acting Director of the School of Nursing, School of Nursing, Nairobi, Aug. 5, 2009.

- <sup>148</sup> Kenya Medical Training College, Introduction to Clinical Medicine (2008) *available at* http://www.kmtc.ac.ke/Academic-Courses/ Diploma-Courses/Clinical-Medicine (last visited Feb. 9, 2010).
- <sup>149</sup> Interview with Micah K. Kisoo, Registrar, Clinical Officers Council and Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, and Manaseh Bocha, Deputy Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, Nairobi, July 22, 2009. See generally, Clinical Officers (Training, Registration and Licensing) Act, Cap. 260 of the Laws of Kenya (Revised ed. 1990).
- <sup>150</sup> Interview with Micah K. Kisoo, Registrar, Clinical Officers Council and Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, and Manaseh Bocha, Deputy Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, Nairobi, July 22, 2009.
- <sup>151</sup> *Id.*
- <sup>152</sup> Interview with Micah K. Kisoo, Registrar, Clinical Officers Council and Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, and Manaseh Bocha, Deputy Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, Nairobi, July 22, 2009; *see also* interview with Manaseh Bocha, Deputy Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, Nairobi, Oct. 29, 2009.
- <sup>153</sup> Interview with Micah K. Kisoo, Registrar, Clinical Officers Council and Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, and Manaseh Bocha, Deputy Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, Nairobi, July 22, 2009.
- <sup>154</sup> Interview with Clinical Officer, Private Clinic, Dandora Phase I, July 3, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>155</sup> Interview with Micah K. Kisoo, Registrar, Clinical Officers Council and Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, and Manaseh Bocha, Deputy Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, Nairobi, July 22, 2009; interview with Manaseh Bocha, Deputy Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, Nairobi, Oct. 29, 2009.
- <sup>156</sup> Interview with Nurse-Midwife/Clinic Owner, Private Clinic, Dandora Phase I, July 3, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>157</sup> Interview with Oscar Oyata, Clinical Officer, Kisumu District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- <sup>158</sup> Interview with Doctor, not-for-profit private clinic, Kisumu, July 9, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>159</sup> Interview with Dr. John Nyamu, Gynecologist with private practice in Nairobi, June 30, 2009.
- <sup>160</sup> Interview with Dr. Juliana Otieno, Chief Administrator, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 28, 2009.
- <sup>161</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, June 5, 2009.
- <sup>162</sup> Interview with Dr. Boaz Nyunya, Professor of OB/GYN, Moi University, Nairobi, June 29, 2009.

<sup>163</sup> Id.

- 164 MOH Post Abortion Care Trainer's Manual at §§1, 29.
- 165 Id. at §§1, 37 (2003).
- Id. at §§1, 37 (2003). 166
- 167 Ministry of Health (Kenya), Essential Obstetric Care Manual (Third ed. 2006), at 68-79.
- 168 Ministry of Health (Kenya), Norms and Standards for Health Service Delivery: Reversing the trends, the Second National Health Sector Strategic Plan of Kenya (2006), available at http://www.hsrs. health.go.ke/publications.htm (for a further description of the different levels of healthcare facilities in Kenya see pages 2-7) [hereinafter MOH Reversing the Trends].
- 169 2004 KSPAS at 21.
- 170 MOH Reversing the Trends at 25.
- 171 2004 KSPAS at 21. 172
- MOH Reversing the Trends at 25. 173
- ld.
- 174 Ministry of Health (Kenya) (Division of Reproductive Health) and Ministry of Planning and National Coordinating Agency for Population and Development (Ministry of Planning and National Development), Adolescent Reproductive Health and Development Policy Plan of Action 12 (2005-2015) available at http://www.drh.go.ke/ documents/Adolescent%20RH%20Plan%20 2005-2015.pdf.
- 175 Id.
- 176 Ministry of Health (Kenya), National Reproductive Health Policy: Enhancing Reproductive Health Status for All Kenyans at 9 (2007).
- 177 Id. at 12.
- 178 Ministry of Health (Kenya) (Division of Reproductive Health), Kenya National Reproductive Health Curriculum for Service Providers (2006).
- 179 Id. at foreword ix.
- 180 Id.
- 181 Id. at foreword 18 (2006).
- 182 National Joint Steering Committee for Maternal Health (Kenya) (Coordinators: Kenya Obstetrician and Gynecologists Society and National Nurses Association of Kenya), Standards for Maternal Care in Kenya (2002). available at http://www.drh.go.ke/ documents/STDs%20for%20maternal%20 care pdf
- 183 Id. at iv, 2.
- 184 Id. at vii.
- 185 Id. at 1.
- 186 Id. at 6. 187
- Id. at 1. 188
- *Id.* at 6. 189
- Id. at 1, 4. 190 Id. at 26.
- 191 ld
- 192 ld.
- 193 ld.
- 194 ld.
- 195 ld
- 196 ld. 197
- ld. 198 Id. at 27.
- 199 Id.
- 200 ld.

- Central Bureau of Statistics, 2003 Kenya 201 Demographic and Health Survey 110 (2004) [hereinafter 2003 KDHS].
- 202 Tony Johnston, Population Communication Africa, The Sexual Abuse of Kenyan Women and Girls: A Briefing Book 6, 14 (2003).
- 203 Renson Mnyamwezi, NGO decries rise in rape cases, The Standard, April 23, 2009, at 9. 204
  - ld.
- 205 2003 KDHS at 244
- 206 Michelle J. Hinden et al., Intimate Partner Violence Among Couples in 10 DHS Countries: Predictors and Health Outcomes xi (United States Agency for International Development, 2008).
- 207 Id. at 63.
- 208 Id. at 62 and Table 4.2 (United States Agency for International Development, 2008).
- 209 Joy Wanja, Teenage Sex Study Shock for Parents, Daily Nation, Oct. 13, 2009.
- 210 Samuel Siringi, Shocking Details of Sex Abuse in Schools, Daily Nation, Nov. 1, 2009 available at http://allafrica.com/ stories/200911020402.html (last visited Feb. 8, 2010). 211
  - ld.
- 212 ld.
- 213 Commission of Inquiry into the Post Election Violence, Final Report (CIPEV) at 265 (Oct. 15, 2008) available at http:// www.communication.go.ke/Documents/ CIPEV\_FINAL\_REPORT.pdf (last visited Feb. 4, 2010) [hereinafter Post Election Violence Commission, Final Report].
- 214 Id. at 247.
- 215 Id. at 247-8.
- 216 Id
- 217 MOH Management of Rape/Sexual Violence at 2
- 218 Stephanie Holmes, Gang Rape Spirals in Violent Kenya, BBC News, Jan. 23, 2008, available at http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/ hi/africa/7204680.stm (last visited Feb. 5, 2010) [hereinafter Holmes, Gang Rape Spirals]; Rape on the Rise in Postelection Violence, IRIN, Jan. 2, 2008, available at http://www.irinnews.org/Report. aspx?ReportId=76068 (last visited Feb. 5, 2010) [hereinafter Rape on the Rise in Postelection Violence].
- 219 Holmes, Gang Rape Spirals; Rape on the Rise in Post-election Violence.
- 220 Post Election Violence Commission, Final Report at 246.
- 221 Women's Commission for Refugee Women and Children, Reproductive Health Coordination Gap, Services Ad hoc: Minimum Initial Service Package (MISP) Assessment in Kenya 14 (2008).
- 222 MOH Management of Rape/Sexual Violence Guidelines at 2.
- 223 Post Election Violence Commission, Final Report at 264.
- 224 Center for Reproductive Rights and Federation of Women Lawyers - Kenya, Failure to Deliver: Violations of Women's Human Rights in Kenyan Health Facilities 23 (2007)[hereinafter Failure to Deliver]

(Interview with Joseph M. Oyongo, Quality Assurance Officer - Christian Health Association of Kenya, Nov. 20, 2006; Interview with Margaret Ogola, National Executive Secretary, and other members of the Catholic Secretariat – Kenya Episcopal Conference, Nairobi, Apr. 10, 2007); interview with Dr. Ayisi, National Executive Secretary, Kenya Episcopal Conference, Catholic Secretariat, Nairobi, Aug. 13, 2009.

- 225 Interview with Sylverns Ater Kagose, Nurse Manager, Suba District Hospital, Sindo, July 8, 2009.
- 226 MOH Management of Rape/Sexual Violence at 2
- 227 See World Health Organization (WHO), Family Planning: A Global Handbook for Providers 45, 49 (2007), available at http:// info.k4health.org/globalhandbook/handbook. pdf (last visited Feb. 4, 2010). See also WHO, Fact sheet No. 244: Emergency Contraception (Oct. 2005), available at http:// www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs244/ en/index.html (last visited Feb. 4, 2010).
- 228 Division of Reproductive Health, Ministry of Health (Kenya), Emergency Contraception: Health Care Providers Quick Reference Guide at 4 (2008).
- 229 Interview with Damarice Otieno, Nurse, Suba District Hospital & private practice, Sindo, July 9, 2009; interview with Sylverns Ater Kagose, Nurse Manager, Suba District Hospital, Sindo, July 8, 2009; interview with Louis Machogu, Programs Pharmacists, Family Health Options Kenya, Nairobi, July 1, 2009; interview with Stephen Kimatu, Head, Medicines Information Department, Pharamcy and Poisons Board, Nariobi, July 20, 2009; interview with Sarah Abuyeka, Nursing Officer, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 28, 2009.
- 230 MOH Management of Rape/Sexual Violence at 8.
- 231 Interview with Mercy Mathai, Nurse, Reproductive Health Services, Nairobi, June 30. 2009.
- 232 Kenya National Bureau of Statistics et al., 2008-2009 Kenya Demographic and Health Survey: Preliminary Report 14 (June 2009). 233 2003 KDHS at 106.
- 234 Failure to Deliver at 18; Joyce Mulama, Contraceptives: Stock-outs Threaten Family Planning, Inter Press Service (Latin America), May 18, 2009; see also National Coordinating Agency for Population and Development, the Ministry of Health, and the Central Bureau of Statistics, The 2004 Kenya Service Provision Assessment Survey-Family Planning Key Findings at 5 available at www.measuredhs.com/pubs/pdf/SR176/ SR176.pdf (last visited Feb. 4, 2010). 235 ld.
- 236 Geoffrey Kamadi, Population Threat to Vision 2030, Daily Nation, May 13, 2009 [hereinafter Kamadi, Population Threat to Vision 2030].
- 237 Joyce Mulama, Contraceptives: Stock-outs Threaten Family Planning, Inter Press Service (Latin America), May 18, 2009.

238 ld

- 239 Id. See also Mike Mwaniki, Shortage of Contraceptives Looms, Daily Nation, Aug. 4, 2009 [hereinafter Mwaniki, Shortage of Contraceptives].
- Joyce Mulama, Contraceptives: Stockouts Threaten Family Planning, Inter Press Service (Latin America), May 18, 2009. See also Mike Mwaniki, Shortage of Contraceptives Looms, Daily Nation, Aug. 4, 2009.
- 241 Elizabeth Mwai, Country Has a Billion Condoms in Stock, The Standard, May 9, 2008, available at http://allafrica.com/ stories/200805081081.html (last visited Feb. 4, 2010).
- 242 Id
- 243 Geoffrey Kamadi, Population Threat to Vision 2030, Daily Nation, May 13, 2009.
- 244 National Coordinating Agency for Population and Development, the Ministry of Health, and the Central Bureau of Statistics, The 2004 Kenya Service Provision Assessment Survey—Family Planning Key Findings available at www.measuredhs.com/pubs/ pdf/SR176/SR176.pdf (last visited Feb. 4, 2010) 9.
- 245 Joyce Mulama, Contraceptives: Stock-outs Threaten Family Planning, Inter Press Service (Latin America), May 18, 2009.
- 246 ld.
- 247 Susan Anyangu, Nyong'o Decries Limited Access to Contraceptives, The Standard, Aug. 4, 2009.
- 248 Id
- 249 Centre for the Study of Adolescence, Down the Drain: Counting the Costs of Teenage Pregnancy and School Drop Out in Kenya 31 (2008) [hereinafter Centre for the Study of Adolescence, Down the Drain].
- 250 Susan Anyangu, Practical Measures Needed on Teen Sexual Education, Inter Press Service, Oct. 27, 2009, available at http:// allafrica.com/stories/200910271243.html (last visited Feb. 4, 2010).
- 251 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009.
- 252 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009.
- 253 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009.
- 254 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- 255 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- 256 Interview with Francisca Bahati, Kenya Registered Community Health Nurse and Family Planning, Coast Provincial General Hospital, Mombasa, Aug. 3, 2009.
- Jill Keesbury et al., Mainstreaming Emergency Contraception (EC) in Kenva: Final Project Report 29 (Population Council, Nairobi, 2009) [hereinafter Mainstreaming Emergency Contraception].
- 258 Id. The Population Council, a non-profit organization focused on reproductive health issues, tracked the sales of four major brands of emergency contraceptives in the private-sector from 2007 to 2009. It documented an increase from 45,870 units

sold in Kenya in Oct. 2007 to 138,150 units sold in June 2009.

- 259 Id. at 20.
- 260 Id
- 261 Id
- 262 ld.
- 263 Id. at 30.
- 264 Id. at 12.
- 265 Interview with Jeremiah Gaunye, Chief Pharmacist, Suba District Hospital, Suba, July 8, 2009.
- 266 Division of Reproductive Health, Ministry of Health (Kenya), Emergency Contraception: Health Care Providers Quick Reference Guide (2008) 3.
- 267 Id. at 4.
- 268 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- Interview with Louis Machogu, Programs 269 Pharmacists, Family Health Options Kenya, Nairobi, July 1, 2009.
- 270 Interview with Sylverns Ater Kagose, Nurse Manager, Suba District Hospital, Sindo, July 8, 2009.
- 271 Interview with Jeremiah Gaunye, Chief Pharmacist, Suba District Hospital, Sindo, July 8, 2009.
- 272 Interview with Stephen Kimatu, Head, Medicines Information Department, Pharmacy and Poisons Board, Nariobi, July 20, 2009; focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- 273 Interview with Stephen Kimatu, Head, Medicines Information Department, Pharmacy and Poisons Board, Nariobi, July 20, 2009. 274

- 275 Interview with Louis Machogu, Programs Pharmacists, Family Health Options Kenya, Nairobi, July 1, 2009; Interview with Stephen Kimatu, Head, Medicines Information Department, Pharamcy and Poisons Board, Nariobi, July 20, 2009.
- 2003 KDHS at 95, Table 6.5. 276
- 277 Centre for the Study of Adolescence, Down the Drain at 31
- 278 Susan Anyangu, Practical Measures Needed on Teen Sexual Education, Inter Press Service, Oct. 27, 2009, available at http:// allafrica.com/stories/200910271243.html (last visited Feb. 4, 2010) ("At St Georges, a public school, aside from a project funded by a non-governmental organisation, there is no sexual education on the curriculum."). 279
- Id.
- 280 Sammy Cheboi, Sex Education Lacking, Says Health Official, The Daily Nation, Sept. 23, 2009, available at http://allafrica.com/ stories/200909230822.html (last visited Feb. 5. 2010).
- 281 Id
- 282 Susan Anyangu, Practical Measures Needed on Teen Sexual Education, Inter Press Service, Oct. 27, 2009, available at http:// allafrica.com/stories/200910271243.html (last visited Feb. 4, 2010). 283

284 Joyce Mulama, Stopping Pregnancy From Being the End of the Educational Road, Inter Press Service, July 28, 2006.

- 285 Centre for the Study of Adolescence, Down the Drain at 28.
- 286 2003 KDHS at 82.
- 287 2003 KDHS at 84.
- 288 Mainstreaming Emergency Contraception 24. For example, even the BBC has reported that regularly using emergency contraceptives can lead to infertility and increase the risk of cancer. 289
- 2003 KDHS at 77.
- 2003 KDHS at 79. 290
- 291 2003 KDHS at 80.
- 292 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009.
- 293 Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- 294 Interview with Grace, Dandora Phase I, July 14, 2009.
- 295 Id
- 296 Interview with Emmaculate, Community Organizer, Kibera, June 30, 2009; interview with Evelyne, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- 297 See World Health Organization (WHO), Family Planning: A Global Handbook for Providers 13, 18 (2007), available at http:// info.k4health.org/globalhandbook/handbook. pdf (last visited Feb. 8, 2010).
- Interview with Emmaculate, Community Organizer, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- A "majority of urban Kenyans" live in slumlike conditions in informal settlements. The Centre on Housing Rights and Evictions, Kenya: Right to Housing and Water, Article 11(1) at 2 (2007). Over 222,000 Kenyans are considered to be "internally displaced persons," residing in makeshift and often unsafe camps, unable to return to their homes due to violence or other factors. United States Agency for International Development, Kenya: Complex Emergency Fact Sheet #2 (FY 2008) at 1 (2008).
- 300 Centre for the Study of Adolescence, Down the Drain at 31.
- 301 Post-violence Sex Work Boom, IRIN, July 9, 2008, available at http://plusnews.org/report. aspx?ReportId=79166 (last visited Feb. 5, 2010).
- 302 ld.
- 303 ld.
- 304 Muchiri Karanja, Sex for Food in Nyeri Slums, The Daily Nation, Oct. 13, 2009, available at http://allafrica.com/ stories/200910131171.html (last visited Feb. 5, 2010).
- 305 Susan Anyangu, Practical Measures Needed on Teen Sexual Education, Inter Press Service, Oct. 27, 2009, available at http:// allafrica.com/stories/200910271243.html (last visited Feb. 4, 2010).
- 306 Kenva's Tourist Coast Attracts Youths. Sex Workers, afrol News, Mar. 9, 2008, available at http://afrol.com/printable article/24664 (last visited Feb. 5, 2010). 307
- Id 308 Committee on the Rights of the Child, Concluding Observations, Kenya, para. 49, U.N. Doc. CRC/C/KEN/CO/2 (2007).

309 2003 KDHS at 62.

310 Centre for the Study of Adolescence, Down the Drain at 28 (2008).

ld.

ld.

- <sup>311</sup> Kwamboka Oyaro, *Teenage Mothers Denied Education*, Inter Press Service, May 23, 2008, *available at* http://ipsnews.net/africa/nota.asp?idnews=42487 (last visited Feb. 5, 2010). *See also* Centre for the Study of Adolescence, Down the Drain at 8.
- <sup>312</sup> Centre for the Study of Adolescence, Down the Drain at 11, citing to the Central Bureau of Statistics, Economic Survey 2007.
- <sup>313</sup> Kwamboka Oyaro, *Teenage Mothers Denied Education*, Inter Press Service, May 23, 2008, *available at* http://ipsnews.net/africa/nota.asp?idnews=42487 (last visited Feb. 5, 2010).
- <sup>314</sup> Centre for the Study of Adolescence, Down the Drain at 46-47.
- <sup>315</sup> *Id.* at 48.
- <sup>316</sup> *Id.*
- <sup>317</sup> Peter Mutai, Lone Girl in Class After 24 Pregnant Students Drop Out, The Standard, Mar. 9, 2009, available at http:// www.eastandard.net/news/InsidePage. php?id=1144023081&cid=4& (last visited Feb. 5, 2010).
- <sup>318</sup> Anthony Kitimo, Pregnancy Causes 28 to Drop Out of School, Daily Nation, Oct. 6, 2009; Anthony Kitimo, Probe Order as 28 Girls Quit School, Daily Nation, Oct. 6, 2009.
- <sup>319</sup> Centre for the Study of Adolescence, Down the Drain at 45.
- <sup>320</sup> Id. at 44; Kwamboka Oyaro, Teenage Mothers Denied Education, Inter Press Service, May 23, 2008, available at http:// ipsnews.net/africa/nota.asp?idnews=42487 (last visited Feb. 5, 2010).
- <sup>321</sup> Centre for the Study of Adolescence, Down the Drain at 8, 44.
- <sup>322</sup> Ellen M. H. Mitchell et al., Social scripts and stark realities: Kenyan adolescents' abortion discourse, 8(6) Culture, Health and Sexuality 524 (Dec. 2006).
- <sup>323</sup> *Id.* at 518 (Dec. 2006), citing Odaga and Heneveld 1995.
- <sup>324</sup> *Id.*, citing Okumu et al., 1994 and Murray et al., 2003.
- <sup>325</sup> *Top KCPE Pupil Dies after Abortion*, East African Standard, Jan. 6, 2005.
- Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Gembe, July 7, 2009.
- <sup>327</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Gembe, July 7, 2009.
- Joyce Mulama, Stopping Pregnancy From Being the End of the Educational Road, Inter Press Service, July 28, 2006.
- <sup>329</sup> Interview with Grace, Dandora Phase I, July 14, 2009.
- <sup>330</sup> The Penal Code at § 240, Cap. 63.
- <sup>331</sup> Medical Practitioners and Dentists Code of Conduct at 16.
- <sup>332</sup> MOH Management of Rape/Sexual Violence at 2.
- <sup>333</sup> Rebecca Cook and Bernard Dickens, *Abortion Laws in African Commonwealth Countries*, 25(2) Journal of African Law, (1981) at 61.
- <sup>334</sup> Hon. Marth Karua, Abortion Under the Kenyan Law: Legal Status of Abortion and Judicial Interpretation as cited in Kenya Medical Association, Maternal Deaths and Unsafe Abortion in Kenya at 46 (Report of

a workshop held at Panarific Hotel, Nairobi, Nov. 4<sup>th -</sup> 6<sup>th</sup>, 2004) *available at* http://www. kma.co.ke/downloads/maternal/maternaldeaths.pdf (last visited Feb. 3, 2010).

- <sup>335</sup> Ellen M. H. Mitchell et al., Social scripts and stark realities: Kenyan adolescents' abortion discourse, 8(6) Culture, Health and Sexuality at 517 (Dec. 2006).
- <sup>336</sup> Id., citing Mitchell et al., TeenWeb Nairobi: Results of a web-based project to survey and educate students about health (2004). Chapel Hill, NC, Ipas.
- <sup>337</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 12, 2009.
- <sup>338</sup> Interviews with Grace, Chastity, Elizabeth, Ida, Martha, Dandora Phase I, July 14, 2009; focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- <sup>339</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed participants, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- <sup>340</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed participants, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- <sup>341</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Gembe, July 7, 2009.
- Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Mombasa, Aug. 3, 2009.
- <sup>343</sup> Ellen M. H. Mitchell et al., Social scripts and stark realities: Kenyan adolescents' abortion discourse, 8(6) Culture, Health and Sexuality at 517 (Dec. 2006).
- <sup>344</sup> Id.
- <sup>345</sup> The preventable pandemic at 1908.
- Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Gembe, July 7, 2009.
- <sup>347</sup> Interview with Martha, Dandora Phase I, July 14, 2009.
- <sup>348</sup> Interview with Milka O'ron'y, Community Health Assistant, Patient Support Center, Mbita Subdistrict Hospital, Mbita, July 7, 2009.
- <sup>349</sup> Id.
- <sup>350</sup> Interview with Charity, Kisumu, July 10, 2009.
- <sup>351</sup> Institute of Economic Affairs Kenya, Profile of Women's Socio-economic Status in Kenya at 18-19 (2008), available at http://www. ieakenya.or.ke/documents/Profiling%20 Women%20in%20Kenya.pdf (last visited Feb. 2, 2010).
- <sup>352</sup> United Nations Development Program, Human Development Report 2009 Data: Kenya, *available at* http://hdrstats.undp.org/ en/buildtables/rc\_report.cfm (last visited Feb. 2, 2010).
- 353 See interview with Oscar Oyata, Clinical Officer, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009; interview with Chastity, Dandora Phase I, July 14, 2009.
- Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Nov. 3, 2009. In contrast, the Fees Guidelines for Medical/Dental Practitioners, issued by the MPDB, lists the minimum fee for termination of pregnancy as ranging from 10,000 – 20,000 Kenyan shillings [\$132-263], depending on whether the provider is performing menstrual regulation, or whether the pregnancy is before or after 12 weeks. The maximum fee for termination ranges

from 20,000 – 40,000 Kenyan shillings [\$263-526], again varying with the stage of pregnancy. The Medical Practitioners and Dentists Board, Fees Guidelines for Medical/ Dental Practitioners at 34 (2<sup>nd ed., 2006).</sup>

- <sup>355</sup> Interview with Dr. John Nyamu, Gynecologist with private practice in Nairobi, June 30, 2009.
- <sup>356</sup> Interview with Doctor, not-for-profit private clinic, Kisumu, July 9, 2009 (name withheld); conversation with unnamed woman, Kisumu, July 8, 2009.
- <sup>357</sup> Interview with Clinical Officer at public hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009
- <sup>358</sup> Interview with Nurse, Nyalenda, Kisumu, July 9, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>359</sup> Interview with Nurse-Midwife, Manyatta, Kisumu, July 9, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>360</sup> Interview with Nurse-Midwife/Clinic Owner, Private Clinic, Dandora Phase I, July 3, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>361</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Rusinga Island, July 7, 2009.
- <sup>362</sup> Interview with Nurse, Nyalenda, Kisumu, July 9, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>363</sup> Interview with Clinical Officer, Private Clinic, Dandora Phase I, July 3, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>364</sup> Interview with Dr. Boaz Nyunya, Professor of OB/GYN, Moi University, Nairobi, June 29, 2009. See also interview with Nurse, Nyalenda, Kisumu, July 9, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>65</sup> Interview with Felix Oiki, KEPI Coordinator, Suba District Health Management Team, Mbita, July 6, 2009.
- <sup>366</sup> Interview with Oscar Oyata, Clinical Officer, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- <sup>367</sup> Interview with Monica Oguttu, Executive Director, Kisumu Medical and Educational Trust, Kisumu, July 28, 2009.
- <sup>368</sup> Kisumu Medical and Educational Trust Training Handout, on file with the Center for Reproductive Rights.
- <sup>369</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 12, 2009.
- <sup>370</sup> Interview with Clinical Officer, Private Clinic, Mbita, July 6, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>371</sup> Neither Mbita Subdistrict Hospital nor Suba District Hospital had gynecologists on staff at the time of interviews. *See* interview with Christine Ong'ete, Reproductive Health Coordinator for Suba District, Mbita, July 6, 2009; Interview with Sylverns Ater Kagose, Nurse Manager, Suba District Hospital, Sindo, July 8, 2009.
- <sup>72</sup> Interview with Monica Oguttu, Executive Director, Kisumu Medical and Educational Trust, Kisumu, July 28, 2009.
- <sup>373</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 12, 2009.
- <sup>374</sup> Interview with Dr. Boaz Nyunya, Professor of OB/GYN, Moi University, Nairobi, June 29, 2009.
- <sup>375</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 12, 2009.

- <sup>376</sup> Interview with Nurse-Midwife, Manyatta, Kisumu, July 9, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>377</sup> Interview with Francisca Bahati, Kenya Registered Community Health Nurse and Family Planning, Coast Provincial General Hospital, Mombasa, Aug. 3, 2009.
- Manpreet Rehal, *All I want is Justice, not Revenge*, Daily Nation, Nov. 10, 2009.
- <sup>379</sup> Id.
- <sup>380</sup> MOH Management of Rape/Sexual Violence at 2.
- <sup>381</sup> Manpreet Rehal, *All I want is Justice, not Revenge,* Daily Nation, Nov. 10, 2009.
- <sup>382</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 12, 2009.
- Interview with Rape Trauma Counselor, Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, Oct. 30, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>384</sup> Interview with Carol Waiganjo, Program Officer, Coalition on Violence Against Women, Nairobi, Oct. 28, 2009.
- <sup>385</sup> Interview with Rape Trauma Counselor, Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, Oct. 30, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>386</sup> Ipas, A National Assessment of the Magnitude and Consequences of Unsafe Abortion in Kenya 20 (2004).
- World Health Organization, Safe Abortion: Technical and Policy Guidance for Health Systems 21, 31 (2003) available at http://whqlibdoc.who.int/ publications/2003/9241590343.pdf.
- <sup>388</sup> *Id.* at 30.
- <sup>389</sup> See, *Failure to Deliver* at 67-72 (discussing complaint mechanisms).
- <sup>390</sup> Interview with Faith Mbehero, Program Officer, National Nurses Association of Kenya, Tsavo, June 24, 2009.
- <sup>391</sup> Pacific Institute for Women's Health and Center for the Study of Adolescence, Community level dynamics of unsafe abortion in western Kenya and opportunities for prevention at 11 (1999); interview with Clinical Officer, Private Clinic, Dandora Phase I, July 3, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>392</sup> Pacific Institute for Women's Health and Center for the Study of Adolescence, Community level dynamics of unsafe abortion in western Kenya and opportunities for prevention at 11 (1999).
- <sup>393</sup> Interview with Clinical Officer, Private Clinic, Dandora Phase I, July 3, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>394</sup> Fed Makana, Op-Ed./Letters, *Shut Down Clinics run by Quacks*, Daily Nation, Sept. 7, 2009: In Sept. 2009, the government did shut down illegal clinics and arrest "quacks with fake academic credentials posing as doctors" in Nairobi and Thika. "The mushrooming private clinics tell it all. The rising number of abortion related deaths have been attributed to these quacks."
- <sup>395</sup> Interview with Dr. Willis Badia, Obstetrician-Gynecologist, Kisumu, July 9, 2009.
- <sup>396</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 12, 2009.
- <sup>397</sup> Kenya Institute for Public Policy Research Analysis (KIPPRA), *A Review of the*

Regulatory Framework for Private Healthcare Services in Kenya, KIPPRA Discussion Paper No. 35 at 60 (2004).

- <sup>398</sup> Interview with Dr. Chris Wagaiyu, Chair, and Stella Mwihaki, Legal Advisor-Kenya Medical Practitioners and Dentists Board, Nairobi, Mar. 13, 2007; see *Failure to Deliver* at 70.
- <sup>399</sup> *Failure to Deliver* at 71(2007).
- <sup>400</sup> Interview with Dr. Stephen Ochiel, Obstetrician-Gynaecologist and Chairperson – Kenya Medical Association, Nov. 24, 2006; see *Failure to Deliver* at 71 (2007).
- <sup>401</sup> Kenya Institute for Public Policy Research Analysis (KIPPRA), *A Review of the Regulatory Framework for Private Healthcare Services in Kenya*, KIPPRA Discussion Paper No. 53 at 63 (2004).
- <sup>402</sup> *Id.* at 56-57.
- <sup>403</sup> *Failure to Deliver* at 67.
- <sup>404</sup> Interview with Dr. Stephen Ochiel, Obstetrician-Gynaecologist and Chairperson
   – Kenya Medical Association, Nairobi, Nov. 24, 2009; see *Failure to Deliver* at 68.
- <sup>405</sup> Interview with Professor Julius Kyambi, Chairman, Medical Practitioners and Dentists Board, Nairobi, July 13, 2009.
- <sup>406</sup> *Id.*
- Interview with Daniel Yumbya, Chief Executive Officer, Medical Practitioners and Dentists Board, Nairobi, July 1, 2009.
   Id
- <sup>409</sup> Medical Practitioners and Dentists Code of Conduct at Appendix II: The Internal Code of Medical Ethics—1949, at 32.
- <sup>410</sup> Interview with Daniel Yumbya, Chief Executive Officer, Medical Practitioners and Dentists Board, Nairobi, July 1, 2009.
- <sup>411</sup> See International Federation of Gynecology and Obstetrics, Resolution on "Conscientious Objection", adopted by the FIGO General Assembly on Nov. 7, 2006 available at http://www.figo.org/projects/conscientious [hereinafter FIGO Resolution]; World Health Organization, Safe Abortion: Technical and Policy Guidance for Health Systems (2003) 66 available at http://whqlibdoc. who.int/publications/2003/9241590343.pdf [hereinafter WHO Safe Abortion Guidance].
- <sup>412</sup> See FIGO Resolution ("[T]o behave ethically, practitioners shall ... 2. Refer patients who request such services or for whose cares such services are medical options to other practitioners who do not object to the provision of such services"); WHO Safe Abortion Guidance ("Health workers have... an ethical obligation to follow professional ethical codes, which usually require health professionals to refer women to skilled colleagues who are not, in principle, opposed to termination of pregnancy allowed by law.").
- <sup>413</sup> FIGO Resolution ("[T]o behave ethically, practitioners shall ... 4. In emergency situations, provide care regardless of practitioners' personal objections."); International Federation of Gynecology and Obstetrics, Code of Ethics: FIGO Professional and Ethical Responsibilities Concerning Sexual and Reproductive Rights A(5) available at http://www.figo.

org/Codeofethics (last visited Feb. 4, 2010) ("Conscientious objection to procedures does not absolve physicians from taking immediate steps in an emergency to ensure that the necessary treatment is given without delay."); and World Medical Association, Declaration on the Rights of the Patient 1(f) (2005) *available at* http://www.wma.net/ en/30publications/10policies/l4/index.html (last Feb. 4, 2010) ("The physician may not discontinue treatment of a patient as long as further treatment is medically indicated, without giving the patient reasonable assistance and sufficient opportunity to make alternative arrangements for care.").

- <sup>414</sup> World Health Organization, Department of Reproductive Health and Research, Complications of abortion: technical and managerial guidelines for prevention and treatment 95 (1995) *available at* http://whqlibdoc.who.int/ publications/1995/9241544694.pdf (last visited Feb. 5, 2010).
- <sup>415</sup> WHO Safe Abortion Guidance 66.
- <sup>416</sup> FIGO Resolution.
- <sup>417</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 12, 2009.
- <sup>418</sup> Interview with Dr. Boaz Nyunya, Professor of OB/GYN, Moi University, Nairobi, June 29, 2009; interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/ KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 12, 2009.
- <sup>419</sup> Interview with Dr. Zahida Qureshi, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 10, 2009; interview with Dr. Njoroge Waithaka, Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, Aug. 11, 2009.
- <sup>420</sup> Interview with Dr. Zahida Qureshi, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 10, 2009; interview with Dr. Njoroge Waithaka, Kenyatta National Hospital, Aug. 11, 2009; interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Nov. 3, 2009.
- <sup>421</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Nov. 3, 2009.
- <sup>422</sup> Interview with Dr. Zahida Qureshi, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 10, 2009.
- <sup>423</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 12, 2009.
- <sup>424</sup> Interview with Dr. Njoroge Waithaka, Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, Aug. 11, 2009.
- 425 Id.
- <sup>426</sup> Id.
- 427 Statistic provided by Administrative Assistant, MPDB, Nairobi, Nov. 2, 2009.
- <sup>428</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Nov. 3, 2009.
- <sup>429</sup> Interview with Nurse, Nyalenda, Kisumu, July 9, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>430</sup> Interview with Elizabeth, Dandora Phase I, July 14, 2009.
- <sup>431</sup> Interview with Emmaculate, Community Organizer in Kibera, Nairobi, June 30, 2009.

- <sup>432</sup> Interview with Evelyne, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- <sup>433</sup> Interview with reproductive rights researcher, Nairobi, Nov. 5, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>434</sup> Id.

<sup>435</sup> Interview with Evelyne, Kibera, July 11, 2009.

- <sup>436</sup> Interview with reproductive rights researcher, Nairobi, Nov. 5, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>437</sup> Interview with Emmaculate, Community Organizer in Kibera, Nairobi, June 30, 2009.
- <sup>438</sup> Interview with reproductive rights researcher, Nairobi, Nov. 5, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>439</sup> Id.; email correspondence with reproductive rights researcher, Jan. 7, 2010 (name withheld).
- <sup>440</sup> Interview with reproductive rights researcher, Nairobi, Nov. 5, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>441</sup> *Id.*
- <sup>442</sup> Id.
- <sup>443</sup> Id.
- <sup>444</sup> Interview with Ida, Dandora Phase I, July 14, 2009.
- <sup>445</sup> Id.
- <sup>446</sup> Interview with reproductive rights researcher, Nairobi, Nov. 5, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>447</sup> MOH Post Abortion Care Trainer's Manual at §§1, 32 (2003).
- <sup>448</sup> Interview with Carol Waiganjo, Program Officer, Coalition on Violence Against Women, Nairobi, Oct. 28, 2009.
- <sup>449</sup> Interview with rape trauma counselor, Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, Oct. 30, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>450</sup> Interview with Carol Waiganjo, Program Officer, Coalition on Violence Against Women, Nairobi, Oct. 28, 2009.
- <sup>451</sup> Interview with rape trauma counselor, Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, Oct. 30, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>452</sup> African Platform for Action, Fifth Regional Conference on Women, Dakar, Senegal, Nov. 16-23, 1994, para. 42, U.N. Doc. E/ CN.6/1995/5/Add.2 (1995).
- <sup>453</sup> CEDAW Committee, General Recommendation No. 21: Equality in marriage and family relations, para. 21, U.N. Doc. A/49/38 (1994) [hereinafter CEDAW General Recommendation No. 21].
- <sup>454</sup> CEDAW Committee, General Recommendation 24: Women and health, para. 28 U.N. Doc. A/54/38 (1999).
- 455 CEDAW General Recommendation No. 21 at para. 21.
- <sup>456</sup> Andrew Gumbel, *Colombian ruling breaks seal on abortion rights in Latin America*, The Independent, May 13, 2006, *available at* http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/ americas/colombian-ruling-breaks-seal-onabortion-rights-in-latin-america-477939.html (last visited Feb. 3, 2010).
- <sup>457</sup> Hernandez Mora, La ley llega tarde para Marta, El Mundo, May 13, 2006, available at http://www.womenslinkworldwide.org/ pdf\_programs/es\_prog\_rr\_col\_articles\_4.pdf; See also, Women's Link Worldwide, Marta's Story, As performed by Jane Krakowski at International Women's Day event, co-sponsored by International Women's Health Coalition and Glamour Magazine: The

Story of My Body (Mar. 8, 2007) *available at* http://www.iwhc.org/index.php?option=com\_content&task=view&id=2138&Itemid=824.

- <sup>458</sup> Human Rights Committee, General Comment 28: Equality of rights between men and women, para. 11, U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/21/ Rev.1/Add.10 (2000).
- <sup>459</sup> Tysiac v. Poland, application no. 5410/03, §§7-18, European Court of Human Rights 2007-IV [hereinafter Tysiac v. Poland].
- 460 Tysiac v. Poland, at §18.
   461 Tysiac v. Poland at §100
- <sup>461</sup> *Tysiac v. Poland* at §109.
   <sup>462</sup> This standard was recently developed further at the level of the Council of Europe. See Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, *Resolution 1607 (2008) Access to safe and legal abortion in Europe*, adopted by the Assembly April 16, 2008 (15th Sitting) *available at* http://assembly.coe.int/Main. asp?link=/Documents/AdoptedText/ta08/ ERES1607.htm (last visited Feb. 3, 2010).
- <sup>463</sup> *Tysiac v. Poland*, at §116.
- <sup>464</sup> *Tysiac v. Poland* at §117.
- <sup>465</sup> *Tysiac v. Poland* at §§117, 118.
- <sup>466</sup> *Tysiac v. Poland* at §§148, 152.
- <sup>467</sup> K.L. v. Peru, communication no. 1153/2003, §§2,1, 2.3, 2.6, United Nations Human Rights Committee (2005) [hereinafter K.L. v. Peru].
   <sup>468</sup> K.L. v. Peru at §6.3.
- 468 K.L. v. Peru at §6.3.
   469 K.L. v. Peru at §6.3.
- Paulina del Carmen Ramírez Jacinto v.
   Mexico, petition no. 161-02, Inter-American Commission on Human Rights (2007).
- <sup>471</sup> Ziraba, *Maternal mortality: what do we know?* <sup>472</sup> Interview with Evelyne, Kibera, July 11,
- 2009.
   <sup>473</sup> Interview with Damarice Otieno, Nurse, Suba
- <sup>273</sup> Interview with Damarice Otieno, Nurse, Suba District Hospital & private practice, Sindo, July 8, 2009.
- <sup>474</sup> Interview with Nurse-Midwife/Clinic Owner, Private Clinic, Dandora Phase I, July 3, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>475</sup> Interview with Grace, Dandora Phase I, July 14, 2009.
- <sup>476</sup> Interview with Emmaculate, Community Organizer in Kibera, Nairobi, June 30, 2009.
   <sup>477</sup> National Joint Stanging Committee for
- <sup>77</sup> National Joint Steering Committee for Maternal Health (Kenya) (Coordinators: Kenya Obstetrician and Gynecologists Society and National Nurses Association of Kenya), Standards for Maternal Care in Kenya at 27 (2002) available at http://www.drh.go.ke/ documents/STDs%20for%20maternal%20 care.pdf (last visited Jan. 29, 2010).
- <sup>478</sup> Interview with Christine Ong'ete, Reproductive Health Coordinator for Suba District, Mbita, July 6, 2009.
- <sup>479</sup> Interview with Sylverns Ater Kagose, Nurse Manager, Suba District Hospital, Sindo, July 8, 2009.
- <sup>480</sup> Interview with Nurse-Midwife/Clinic Owner, Private Clinic, Dandora Phase I, July 3, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>481</sup> *MOH Post Abortion Care Trainer's Manual* at 1-37.
- <sup>82</sup> Id.
- <sup>483</sup> Interview with Nurse/Administrator, Maternity Hospital, Nairobi, June 20, 2009 (name withheld).

- Interview with Francisca Bahati, Kenya Registered Community Health Nurse and Family Planning, Coast Provincial General Hospital, Mombasa, Aug. 3, 2009.
- <sup>485</sup> Interview with Ida, Dandora Phase I, July 14, 2009.
- <sup>486</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 12, 2009.
- 487 MOH Post Abortion Care Trainer's Manual at 1-32 (2003).
- <sup>488</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009.
   <sup>489</sup> Eocus group discussion with unnamed
- <sup>19</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009.
- Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009.
   Eocus group discussion with unnamed
- Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- <sup>492</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
   <sup>493</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed
- <sup>193</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- <sup>494</sup> MOH Post Abortion Care Trainer's Manual at 1-29.
- <sup>495</sup> Interview with Doctor, not-for-profit private clinic, Kisumu, July 9, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>496</sup> Interview with Dr. Mitei, Obstetrician-Gynecologist Consultant, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, July 28, 2009.
- Interview with Nurse with private clinic, Mbita, July 6, 2009 (name withheld).
   Interview with Nurse with private clinic
- <sup>18</sup> Interview with Nurse with private clinic, Mbita, July 6, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>499</sup> Interview with Nurse-Midwife/Clinic Owner, Dandora Phase I, July 3, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>500</sup> Interview with Grace, Dandora Phase I, July 14, 2009.
- <sup>501</sup> Interview with Felix Oiki, KEPI Coordinator, Suba District Health Management Team, Mbita, July 6, 2009.
- <sup>502</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 12, 2009.
- <sup>503</sup> Community Postabortion Care Project (COMMPAC) in Nakuru District, Kenya: Summary Report, Phase I: July 2005-Sept. 2006, at 12 (USAID, 2007).
   <sup>504</sup> Id
  - ld.
- <sup>505</sup> Abdhalah K Ziraba, et al., *The state of emergency obstetric care services in Nairobi informal settlements and environs: Results from a maternity health facility survey*, 9 (46) BMC Health Services Research at 5 & 7 (2009).
- <sup>506</sup> Interview with Dr. Bartilol Kigen, former Head, Division of Reproductive Health, Ministry of Health, Nairobi, Aug., 10, 2009.
- <sup>507</sup> Interview with Doctor, not-for-profit private clinic, Kisumu, July 9, 2009 (name withheld); interview with Damarice Otieno, Nurse, Suba District Hospital & private practice, Sindo, July 8, 2009; interview with Oscar Oyata, Clinical Officer, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009; interview with Faith Mbehero, Program Officer, National Nurses Association of Kenya, Tsavo, June 24, 2009; interview

with Dr. Njoroge Waithaka, Head of OB/ GYN Department, Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, Aug. 11, 2009; interview with Nurse, Kisumu, July 9, 2009 (name withheld); interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/ KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 12, 2009; focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Kibera, July 11, 2009.

- <sup>508</sup> National Joint Steering Committee for Maternal Health (Kenya) (Coordinators: Kenya Obstetrician and Gynecologists Society and National Nurses Association of Kenya), Standards for Maternal Care in Kenya at 26 (2002) available at http://www. drh.go.ke/documents/STDs%20for%20 maternal%20care.pdf.
- <sup>509</sup> *MOH Post Abortion Care Trainer's Manual* at 1-30.
- <sup>510</sup> See Poverty Section; See also Hon. Martha Karua, Abortion under the Kenyan Law: Legal Status of Abortion and Judicial Interpretation in Report of a Workshop on Maternal Deaths and Unsafe Abortion in Kenya, Nov. 2004, at 46.
- <sup>511</sup> Interview with Evelyne, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
- <sup>512</sup> Interview with Christine Ong'ete, Reproductive Health Coordinator for Suba District, Mbita, July 6, 2009.
- <sup>513</sup> Interview with Sylverns Ater Kagose, Nurse Manager, Suba District Hospital, Sindo, July 8, 2009.
- <sup>514</sup> Interview with Dr. Aggrey Otieno Akula, Medical Superintendent, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- <sup>515</sup> Interview with Dr. Willis Badia, Obstetrician-Gynecologist, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 9, 2009.
- <sup>516</sup> Interview with Francisca Bahati, Kenya Registered Community Health Nurse and Family Planning, Coast Provincial General Hospital, Mombasa, Aug. 3, 2009.
- <sup>517</sup> Interview with Dr. Njoroge Waithaka, Head of OB/GYN Department, Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, Aug. 11, 2009.
- <sup>518</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 12, 2009 and Nov. 3, 2009.
- <sup>519</sup> Interview with Dr. Bartilol Kigen, former Head, Division of Reproductive Health,
- Ministry of Health, Nairobi, Aug., 10, 2009.
   Interview with Dr. Stephen Ochiel, Obstetrician-Gynecologist, University of
- Nairobi, June 19, 2009.
  <sup>521</sup> Interview with Dr. Aggrey Otieno Akula, Medical Superintendent, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009; interview with Dr. Jennifer Othigo, Reproductive Health Advisor for Coast Province, Division of Reproductive Health, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009; interview with Dr. Njoroge Waithaka, Head of OB/GYN Department, Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, Aug. 11, 2009.
- <sup>522</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009.
- <sup>523</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Kibera, July 11, 2009.

- <sup>524</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Gembe, July 7, 2009.
- <sup>525</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Gembe, July 7, 2009.
   <sup>526</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed
- <sup>526</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
   <sup>527</sup> Interview With Examines Paletti Konna
- <sup>227</sup> Interview with Francisca Bahati, Kenya Registered Community Health Nurse and Family Planning, Coast Provincial General Hospital, Mombasa, Aug. 3, 2009.
- Interview with Dr. Aggrey Otieno Akula, Medical Superintendent, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
   Interview with Eransiesa Babati, Konya
- Interview with Francisca Bahati, Kenya Registered Community Health Nurse and Family Planning, Coast Provincial General Hospital, Mombasa, Aug. 3, 2009; interview with Dr. Jennifer Othigo, Reproductive Health Advisor for Coast Province. Division of Reproductive Health, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009; interview with Damarice Otieno, Nurse, Suba District Hospital, Sindo, July 8. 2009: interview with Sarah Abuveka. Nursing Officer, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 28, 2009; interview with Dr. Aggrey Otieno Akula, Medical Superintendent, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009; interview with Dr. Mitei, Obstetrician-Gynecologist Consultant, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 28, 2009.
- <sup>530</sup> Interview with Nurse with private clinic, Mbita, July 6, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>531</sup> Interview with Nurse, Mbita, July 6, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>532</sup> Interview with Mercy Mathai, Nurse, Private Practice, Nairobi, June 30, 2009.
- <sup>533</sup> Interview with Damarice Otieno, Nurse, Suba District Hospital & private practice, Sindo, July 8, 2009.
- <sup>534</sup> Interview with Doctor, not-for-profit private clinic, Kisumu, July 9, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>535</sup> Interview with Dr. Jean Kaggia, Obstetrician-Gynecologist, Upper Hill Medical Centre, Nairobi, Aug. 12, 2009.
- <sup>536</sup> Interview with Felix Oiki, KEPI Coordinator, Suba District Health Management Team, Mbita, July 6, 2009.
- <sup>537</sup> Community Postabortion Care Project (COMMPAC) in Nakuru District, Kenya: Summary Report, Phase I: July 2005-Sept. 2006, at x (USAID, 2007).
- <sup>538</sup> Interview with Francisca Bahati, Kenya Registered Community Health Nurse and Family Planning, Coast Provincial General Hospital, Mombasa, Aug. 3, 2009.
- <sup>539</sup> Interview with Nurse, Mbita, July 6, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>540</sup> Interview with Grace, Dandora Phase I, July 14, 2009.
- <sup>541</sup> Interview with Damarice Otieno, Nurse, Suba District Hospital & private practice, Sindo, July 8, 2009; interview with Sylverns Ater Kagose, Nurse Manager, Suba District Hospital, Sindo, July 8, 2009.
- <sup>542</sup> Failure to Deliver at 54, citing Ricardo Bitrán & Ursula Giedion, Waivers and Exemptions for Health Services in Developing Countries 72 (Social Protection Unit, The World Bank,

Social Protection Discussion Paper Series No. 0308, Mar. 2003), *available at* http:// www-wds.worldbank.org (last visited Feb. 8, 2010).

- <sup>543</sup> *Failure to Deliver* at 52.
- <sup>544</sup> Interview with Dr. Aggrey Otieno Akula, Medical Superintendent, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- <sup>545</sup> Interview with Sarah Abuyeka, Nursing Officer, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 28, 2009.
- <sup>546</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Nov. 3, 2009.
- <sup>547</sup> Interview with Sarah Abuyeka, Nursing Officer, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 28, 2009.
- <sup>548</sup> *Failure to Deliver* at 54.
- <sup>549</sup> *Id.* at 52-53.
- <sup>550</sup> Edmund Sander, In Kenya, patients held hostage to medical bills, Los Angeles Times, June 27, 2009, available at http://articles. latimes.com/2009/jun/28/world/fg-kenyahealthcare28.
- <sup>551</sup> Failure to Deliver at 56-58.
- <sup>552</sup> *Id.* at 57.
- <sup>553</sup> Interview with Dr. Njoroge Waithaka, Head of OB/GYN Department, Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, Aug. 11, 2009.
- <sup>554</sup> Interview with Dr. Qureshi, Professor of OB/ GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Aug. 10, 2009.
- <sup>555</sup> Interview with Dr. Njoroge Waithaka, Head of OB/GYN Department, Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, Aug. 11, 2009.

- <sup>57</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 12, 2009.
- Edmund Sander, In Kenya, patients held hostage to medical bills, Los Angeles Times, June 27, 2009, available at http://articles. latimes.com/2009/jun/28/world/fg-kenyahealthcare28.
- <sup>559</sup> Interview with Nurse, National Nurses Association of Kenya and Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, Nov. 5, 2009(name withheld).
- <sup>560</sup> Id.
- <sup>561</sup> *Id.* 
  - <sup>2</sup> For abusive spouses and relatives refusing to pay user fees, see *Failure to Deliver* at 58.
- <sup>563</sup> Interview with Nurse, National Nurses Association of Kenya and Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, Nov. 5, 2009(name withheld).
- <sup>564</sup> Interview with Nurse, National Nurses Association of Kenya and Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, Nov. 5, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>565</sup> Interview with Oscar Oyata, Clinical Officer, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- <sup>566</sup> Id.
- <sup>567</sup> *Id.* 
  - Edmund Sander, *In Kenya, patients held hostage to medical bills*, Los Angeles Times, June 27, 2009, *available at* http://articles. latimes.com/2009/jun/28/world/fg-kenya-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>556</sup> *Id.* 

healthcare28 [hereinafter *Patients held* hostage to medical bills].

- <sup>569</sup> Medical Practitioners and Dentists Code of Conduct, Chapter V, 7(iii) at 30.
- <sup>570</sup> *Patients held hostage to medical bills*, citing Njoroge Baiya.
- <sup>571</sup> 2004 KSPAS, *Overview of the health system in Kenya* at 33.
- <sup>572</sup> Id
- 573 MOH Post Abortion Care Trainer's Manual at §§1, 30, citing Ministry of Health (Kenya), Reproductive Health Guidelines and Standards for Service Providers (1997).
- <sup>574</sup> Interview with Felix Oiki, KEPI Coordinator, Suba District Health Management Team, Mbita, July 6, 2009.
- <sup>575</sup> *MOH Post Abortion Care Trainer's Manual* at §§1, 37 (2003).
- <sup>576</sup> Interview with Oscar Oyata, Clinical Officer, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- <sup>577</sup> Interview with Dr. Aggrey Otieno Akula, Medical Superintendent, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- <sup>578</sup> Id.
- <sup>579</sup> Interview with Felix Oiki, KEPI Coordinator, Suba District Health Management Team, Mbita, July 6, 2009.
- <sup>580</sup> Id.
- <sup>581</sup> Interview with Christine Ong'ete, Reproductive Health Coordinator for Suba District, Mbita, July 6, 2009.
- <sup>582</sup> Interview with Dr. Mitei, Obstetrician-Gynecologist Consultant, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 28, 2009; interview with Francisca Bahati, Kenya Registered Community Health Nurse and Family Planning, Coast Provincial General Hospital, Mombasa, Aug. 3, 2009.
- Interview with Nurse, Kisumu, July 9, 2009 (name withheld); Interview with Nurse, Mbita, July 6, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>584</sup> Interview with Nurse, Mbita, July 6, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>585</sup> Id.
- <sup>586</sup> Ministry of Health (Kenya) (Division of Reproductive Health), Kenya National Reproductive Health Curriculum for Service Providers (2006).
   <sup>587</sup> Id. at foround in
- <sup>587</sup> *Id. at foreword*, ix.
- <sup>588</sup> *Id.* at18.
- <sup>589</sup> Interview with Nurse-Midwife/Clinic Owner, Private Clinic, Dandora Phase I, July 3, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>590</sup> Interview with Faith Mbehero, Program Officer, National Nurses Association of Kenya, Tsavo, June 24, 2009.
- <sup>591</sup> Id.
- <sup>592</sup> Id.
- <sup>593</sup> Interview with Mercy Mathai, Nurse, Private Practice, Nairobi, June 30, 2009.
- <sup>594</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Kibera, July 11, 2009.
   <sup>595</sup> Ecous group discussion with unnamed
- <sup>595</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009.
   <sup>596</sup> Interview with Oscar Oyata, Clinical Officer,
- <sup>596</sup> Interview with Oscar Oyata, Clinical Officer, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- <sup>597</sup> Interview with Oscar Oyata, Clinical Officer, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July

27, 2009; interview with Dr. Aggrey Otieno Akula, Medical Superintendent, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.

- <sup>598</sup> Interview with Oscar Oyata, Clinical Officer, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- <sup>599</sup> Interview with Damarice Otieno, Nurse, Suba District Hospital & private practice, Sindo, July 8, 2009.

- <sup>601</sup> Id
- <sup>602</sup> Interview with Sylverns Ater Kagose, Nurse Manager, Suba District Hospital, Sindo, July 8, 2009.
- <sup>603</sup> Id
- <sup>604</sup> Interview with Oscar Oyata, Clinical Officer, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- <sup>605</sup> Interview with Sylverns Ater Kagose, Nurse Manager, Suba District Hospital, Sindo, July 8, 2009.
- Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Nairobi, Feb. 9, 2007; Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Nairobi, Feb. 9, 2007; *see Failure to Deliver* at 25.
- <sup>607</sup> Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Nairobi, Feb. 9, 2007; *see Failure to Deliver* at 25.
- Focus group discussion with unnamed participant, Mombasa, Aug. 4, 2009.
   MOH Post Abortion Care Trainar's Manual
- MOH Post Abortion Care Trainer's Manual at §§1, 37.
- 610 *Id.* at §§1, 29.
- Interview with Oscar Oyata, Clinical Officer, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
   Id
- 613
- 513 Id.
- <sup>614</sup> Interview with Damarice Otieno, Nurse, Suba District Hospital & private practice, Sindo, July 8, 2009.
- <sup>615</sup> Interview with Faith Mbehero, Program Officer, National Nurses Association of Kenya, Tsavo, June 24, 2009.
- <sup>616</sup> Interview with Dr. Njoroge Waithaka, Head of OB/GYN Department, Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, Aug. 11, 2009.
- <sup>617</sup> Interview with David Wambuku, Education Officer, and Frederick Ochieno, Education Officer and Deputy Registrar, Nursing Council of Kenya, Nairobi, July 20, 2009.
- <sup>618</sup> See World Health Organization, Complications of Abortion: Technical and managerial guidelines for prevention and treatment 42-43 (1995).
- <sup>619</sup> See World Health Organization, Complications of Abortion: Technical and managerial guidelines for prevention and treatment 55-56 (1995). (On page 55 the guidelines specify that "[w]hile general, regional and local anaesthesia have all been used in abortion care, local anaesthesia should suffice for the majority of uterine evacuation procedures.").
- <sup>620</sup> Word Health Organization, Clinical management of abortion complications: a practical guide 53 (1994).
- <sup>621</sup> World Health Organization, Safe Abortion: Technical and Policy

Guidance for Health Systems 34 (2003), available at http://whqlibdoc.who.int/ publications/2003/9241590343.pdf. See also Word Health Organization, Clinical management of abortion complications: a practical guide, Annex 4, 61 (1994), available at http://whqlibdoc.who.int/ hq/1994/WHO\_FHE\_MSM\_94.1.pdf.

- <sup>622</sup> MOH Post Abortion Care Trainer's Manual at §§5, 1.
- <sup>623</sup> Ipas, A National Assessment of the Magnitude and Consequences of Unsafe Abortion in Kenya 26 (2004).
- <sup>624</sup> The magnitude of abortion complications in Kenya at 1234.
- 625 *Id.* 
  - Interview with Oscar Oyata, Clinical Officer, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009; interview with Dr. Aggrey Otieno Akula, Medical Superintendent, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009; interview with Christine Ong'ete, Reproductive Health Coordinator for Suba District, Mbita, July 6, 2009.
- <sup>627</sup> Interview with Dr. Aggrey Otieno Akula, Medical Superintendent, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- Interview with Oscar Oyata, Clinical Officer, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- <sup>629</sup> 2004 KSPAS: Family Planning Key Findings, Appendix B, Table A-6.37 288 (2006).
- E-mail from Dr. Nehemiah Kimathi, Technical Advisor, Safe Motherhood, International Planned Parenthood Federation Kenya ("I have talked to the Chief Pharmacist ministry of health (Dr C K Koske) who says that the drugs [analgesics] are available at all levels of care – dispensaries, health centres and hospitals.") to Reproductive Health and Rights Alliance, Feb. 3, 2010 (on file with the Center for Reproductive Rights).
- <sup>631</sup> The magnitude of abortion complications in Kenya at 1234; Interview with Dr. Joachim Osur, Reproductive Health Expert, Nairobi, Nov. 2, 2009; interview with Doctor, not-forprofit private clinic, Kisumu, July 9, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>632</sup> Interview with Dr. Joachim Osur, Reproductive Health Expert, Nairobi, Nov. 2, 2009.
- Interview with Dr. Aggrey Otieno Akula, Medical Superintendent, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
   Interview with Dr. Josefim Osur
- <sup>334</sup> Interview with Dr. Joachim Osur, Reproductive Health Expert, Nairobi, Nov. 2, 2009.
- <sup>35</sup> Interview with Dr. Njoroge Waithaka, Head of OB/GYN Department, Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi, Aug. 11, 2009; interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/ GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Nov. 3, 2009.
- <sup>636</sup> Interview with Dr. Joachim Osur, Reproductive Health Expert, Nairobi, Nov. 2, 2009.
- <sup>637</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Nov. 3, 2009.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>600</sup> *Id.* 

- 638 ld
- 639 The magnitude of abortion complications in Kenya at 1234.
- 640 Interview with Dr. Joachim Osur, Reproductive Health Expert, Nairobi, Nov. 2, 2009
- 641 Id
- 642 Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Nov. 3, 2009.
- 643 Id
- 644 ld.
- 645 Kenya Institute for Public Policy Research Analysis (KIPPRA), A Review of the Regulatory Framework for Private Healthcare Services in Kenya, KIPPRA Discussion Paper No. 35 at 60 (2004).
- 646 Interview with official with close ties to the Medical Board, Nairobi, July 1, 2009 (name withheld).
- 647 Interview with Dr. Zahida Qureshi, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 10, 2009.
- 648 ld.
- 649 Interview with Christine Ong'ete, Reproductive Health Coordinator for Suba District, Mbita, July 6, 2009.
- Ministry of Health (Kenya), Implementation Plan for National Reproductive Health Strategy: 1999-2003 (Dec. 1998) 6, 9. Note: According to the Division of Reproductive Health, this strategy remains in place as of Oct. 2009. There has been no new strategy issued to address the period from 2004 to the present. (Conversation with Resource Librarian, Division of Reproductive Health, Nairobi, Oct. 30, 2009)
- 651 All taken from World Health Organization, Safe Abortion: Technical and Policy Guidance for Health Systems 29-30 (2003), available at http://whglibdoc.who.int/ publications/2003/9241590343.pdf (last visited Feb. 4, 2010).
- 652 Charlotte E. Hord, Making safe abortion accessible: A practical guide for advocates, Ipas 9 (2001) available at http://www.ipas. org/Publications/asset\_upload\_file495\_3176. pdf (last visited Feb. 4, 2010).
- 653 World Health Organization, Education material for teachers of midwifery: midwifery education modules-Managing incomplete abortion 115 (2<sup>nd</sup> ed., 2008). 654 Id
- 655 Charlotte E. Hord, Making safe abortion accessible: A practical guide for advocates, Ipas 9 (2001), available at http://www.ipas. org/Publications/asset\_upload\_file495\_3176. pdf (last visited Feb. 4, 2010).
- 656 World Health Organization, Clinical Management of Abortion Complications: A Practical Guide (1994) 19, available at http:// whqlibdoc.who.int/hq/1994/WHO\_FHE\_ MSM\_94.1.pdf.
- 657 World Health Organization, Educational materials for teachers of midwifery: midwifery education modules-Managing incomplete abortion 62 (2nd ed., 2008), available at http://whqlibdoc.who.int/

publications/2008/9789241546669\_3\_eng. pdf (last visited Feb. 4, 2010).

- 658 Charlotte E. Hord, Making safe abortion accessible: A practical guide for advocates, Ipas 9 (2001) available at http://www.ipas. org/Publications/asset\_upload\_file495\_3176. pdf (last visited Feb. 4, 2010).
- 659 ld.
- 660 Ipas, Medical Abortion (internet factsheet), available at http://www.ipas.org/topics/ medical\_abortion.aspx (last visited Feb. 4, 2010).
- 661 Ipas, Misoprostol and Medical Abortion in Africa 1 (2009) available at www.ipas.org/ Publications/asset\_upload\_file683\_4512.pdf (last visited Feb. 4, 2010).
- 662 Interview with Micah K. Kisoo, Registrar, Clinical Officers Council and Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, and Manaseh Bocha, Deputy Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, Nairobi, July 22, 2009.
- 663 Interview with Oscar Ovata, Clinical Officer, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- 664 Kenya Medical Training College, Introduction to Clinical Medicine (2008) available at http://www.kmtc.ac.ke/Academic-Courses/ Diploma-Courses/Clinical-Medicine (last visited Feb. 9, 2010).
- 665 Failure to Deliver at 70, citing Interview with Clinical Officers Council official, Nairobi, Feb. 7.2007
- 666 2004 KSPAS at 112.
- 667 Interview with Micah K. Kisoo, Registrar, Clinical Officers Council and Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, and Manaseh Bocha, Deputy Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, Nairobi, July 22, 2009.
- 668 ld.
- 669 Id
- 670 2004 KSPAS at 21, Table 2.3.
- Clinical Officers Council, Clinical Officers 671 Training Curriculum, CMS 364: Reproductive Health, Module IV, Unit 1: Operative Obstetrics/Gynaecology, 104-105 (no date provided; on file with the Center for Reproductive Rights).
- 672 Interview with Micah K. Kisoo, Registrar. Clinical Officers Council and Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, and Manaseh Bocha, Deputy Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, Nairobi, July 22, 2009.
- 673 Interview with Sylverns Ater Kagose, Nurse Manager, Suba District Hospital, Sindo, July 8.2009.
- 674 Interview with Dr. Aggrey Otieno Akula, Medical Superintendent, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- 675 Interview with Clinical Officer, Private Clinic, Dandora Phase I, July 3, 2009 (name withheld); interview with Oscar Oyata, Clinical Officer, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009. The 2008 National Reproductive Health Training Plan makes reference to this, stating that clinical officers are required to "conduct manual vacuum aspiration ... in some hospitals

only." Ministry of Health (Kenya), National Reproductive Health Training Plan: 2007-2012 at 10 (May 2008).

- Interview with Micah K. Kisoo, Registrar, 676 Clinical Officers Council and Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, and Manaseh Bocha, Deputy Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, Nairobi, July 22, 2009.
- 677 ld.
- 678 ld
- 679 ld.
- 680 Clinical Officers Council, Clinical Officers Training Curriculum, CMS 364: Reproductive Health, Module IV, Unit 1: Operative Obstetrics/Gynaecology, 104-105 (no date provided; on file with the Center for Reproductive Rights).
- 681 Interview with Oscar Oyata, Clinical Officer, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- 682 Interview with Micah K. Kisoo, Registrar, Clinical Officers Council and Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, and Manaseh Bocha, Deputy Chief Clinical Officer, Ministry of Medical Services, Nairobi, July 22, 2009. ld.
- 683 684

ld.

- 685 Interview with Sylverns Ater Kagose, Nurse Manager, Suba District Hospital, Sindo, July 8, 2009.
- 686 World Health Organization, Complications of Unsafe Abortion: technical and managerial guidelines for prevention and treatment (2005) 49 available at http://whqlibdoc.who. int/publications/1995/9241544694.pdf (last visited Feb. 9, 2010). Interview with Monica Oguttu, Executive Director, Kisumu Medical and Educational Trust, Kisumu, July 28, 2009. See also interview with Dr. Aggrey Otieno Akula, Medical Superintendent, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- 687 Interview with Oscar Oyata, Clinical Officer, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- 688 Ipas, A National Assessment of the Magnitude and Consequences of Unsafe Abortion in Kenya 17 (2004).
- 689 Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 12, 2009.
- 690 See 2004 KSPAS 21, Table 2.3.
- 691 Interview with David Wambuku, Education Officer, and Frederick Ochieno, Education Officer and Deputy Registrar, Nursing Council of Kenya, Nairobi, July 20, 2009. 692 ld.
- 693 ld.
- 694 Id
- 695 Interview with Dr. Grace Omoni, Senior Lecturer in Obstetrics and Midwifery, Dr. Blasio Omuga, Lecturer in Obstetrics and Midwifery and OB/GYN, Mrs. Margaret Mwiva, Senior Lecturer in Medical/Surgical Nursing, Mrs. Theresa Odero, Acting Director of the School of Nursing, School of Nursing, Nairobi, Aug. 5, 2009.

- <sup>697</sup> Id.
- 698 *Id.*
- <sup>699</sup> Id.
- <sup>700</sup> *Id.*
- <sup>701</sup> Dr. Bartilol Kigen, former Head, Division of Reproductive Health, Ministry of Health, Nairobi, Aug., 10, 2009.
- MOH Reversing the Trends at 9, 29.
   Ministry of Health (Kenya), National Reproductive Health Curriculum for Service Providers ix, 18 (2006).
- <sup>704</sup> Interview with David Wambuku, Education Officer, and Frederick Ochieno, Education Officer and Deputy Registrar, Nursing Council of Kenya, Nairobi, July 20, 2009.
- <sup>705</sup> Id.
- <sup>706</sup> Interview with Nurse-midwife/Clinic Owner, Private Clinic, Dandora Phase I, July 3, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>707</sup> Interview with Felix Oiki, KEPI Coordinator, Suba District Health Management Team, Mbita, July 6, 2009.
- <sup>708</sup> Interview with Faith Mbehero, Program Officer, National Nurses Association of Kenya, Tsavo, June 24, 2009.
- <sup>709</sup> Interview with Dr. Aggrey Otieno Akula, Medical Superintendent, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- <sup>710</sup> *Id.*
- <sup>711</sup> Interview with Dr. Grace Omoni, Senior Lecturer in Obstetrics and Midwifery, Dr. Blasio Omuga, Lecturer in Obstetrics and Midwifery and OB/GYN, Mrs. Margaret Mwiva, Senior Lecturer in Medical/Surgical Nursing, Mrs. Theresa Odero, Acting Director of the School of Nursing, School of Nursing, Nairobi, Aug. 5, 2009.
- <sup>712</sup> Interview with Faith Mbehero, Program Officer, National Nurses Association of Kenya, Tsavo, June 24, 2009.
- <sup>713</sup> World Health Organization, World Health Organization Statistics 2009: Health workforce, infrastructure, essential medicines: Kenya (2009) 98 available at http://www.who.int/whosis/whostat/EN\_ WHS09\_Full.pdf (last visited Feb. 9, 2010).
- <sup>714</sup> The Penal Code at § 240, Cap. 63.
- <sup>715</sup> Interview with Faith Mbehero, Program Officer, National Nurses Association of Kenya, Tsavo, June 24, 2009.
- <sup>716</sup> Committee on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights, Report of the Special Rapporteur, Paul Hunt, U.N. Doc. E/CN.4/2004/49, para.30 (Feb. 16, 2004).
- <sup>717</sup> Interview with Faith Mbehero, Program Officer, National Nurses Association of Kenya, Nairobi, Nov. 3, 2009.
- <sup>718</sup> Interview with Manaseh Bocha, Deputy Chief Clinical Officer, Focal Person for Reproductive Health, Ministry of Health, Oct. 29, 2009.
- <sup>719</sup> Interview with David Wambuku, Education Officer, and Frederick Ochieno, Education Officer and Deputy Registrar, Nursing Council of Kenya, Nairobi, July 20, 2009.
- <sup>720</sup> Interview with Dr. Blasio Omuga, Lecturer in Obstetrics and Midwifery and OB/GYN, School of Nursing, Nairobi, Aug. 5, 2009.
- <sup>721</sup> Id.

- American Psychological Association Task Force on Mental Health and Abortion, Report of the Task Force on Mental Health and Abortion 4 (2008). See also Nada Stotland, The myth of the abortion trauma syndrome, 268 (15) Journal of the American Medical Association (1992) 2078-2079.
- <sup>723</sup> Interview with Dr. Grace Omoni, Senior Lecturer in Obstetrics and Midwifery, Dr. Blasio Omuga, Lecturer in Obstetrics and Midwifery and OB/GYN, Mrs. Margaret Mwiva, Senior Lecturer in Medical/Surgical Nursing, Mrs. Theresa Odero, Acting Director of the School of Nursing, School of Nursing, Nairobi, Aug. 5, 2009.
- <sup>724</sup> Id.
- Interview with Milka O'ron'y, Community Health Assistant, Patient Support Center, Mbita Subdistrict Hospital, Mbita, July 7, 2009.
  - 5 Id.
- <sup>727</sup> Interview with Dr. Bartilol Kigen, former Head, Division of Reproductive Health, Ministry of Health, Nairobi, Aug., 10, 2009.
   <sup>728</sup> Id.
- <sup>729</sup> 2004 KSPAS at Table A-6.43.1, 294 (Nov. 2005).
- <sup>730</sup> *Id. at* Appendix B, Table A-6.43.2, 295.
- <sup>731</sup> *Id. at* Appendix B, Table A-7.5, 301.
- <sup>732</sup> Dr. Bartilol Kigen, former Head, Division of Reproductive Health, Ministry of Health, Nairobi, Aug., 10, 2009.
- <sup>733</sup> Interview with Nurse/Administrator, Maternity Hospital, Nairobi, June 20, 2009 (name withheld).
- <sup>734</sup> Interview with Felix Oiki, KEPI Coordinator, Suba District Health Management Team, Mbita, July 6, 2009.
- <sup>735</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Aug. 12, 2009.
- <sup>736</sup> Interview with Christine Ong'ete, Reproductive Health Coordinator for Suba District, Mbita, July 6, 2009.
- <sup>737</sup> Interview with Dr. Aggrey Otieno Akula, Medical Superintendent, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
- <sup>738</sup> Interview with Dr. Joachim Osur, reproductive health expert, Nairobi, Nov. 2, 2009.
- <sup>739</sup> Id.
- <sup>740</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Nov. 3, 2009.
- <sup>741</sup> Id.
- <sup>742</sup> Interview with Dr. Joachim Osur, reproductive health expert, Nairobi, Nov. 2, 2009.
- <sup>743</sup> Ipas, National Assessment of the Magnitude and Consequences of Unsafe Abortion in Kenya vi (2004), Foreword by Dr. James Nyikal, Director of Medical Services, Ministry of Health (Kenya).
- <sup>744</sup> Ipas, A National Assessment of the Magnitude and Consequences of Unsafe Abortion in Kenya Foreword at v (2004).
- <sup>745</sup> Interview with Oscar Oyata, Clinical Officer, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.

- <sup>746</sup> Interview with Sarah Abuyeka, Nursing Officer, New Nyanza Provincial Hospital, Kisumu, July 28, 2009.
- <sup>747</sup> Interview with Felix Oiki, KEPI Coordinator, Suba District Health Management Team, Mbita, July 6, 2009.
- <sup>748</sup> Interview with Faith Mbehero, Program Officer, National Nurses Association of Kenya, Tsavo, June 24, 2009.
- <sup>749</sup> Interview with Dr. Joachim Osur, reproductive health expert, Nairobi, Nov. 2, 2009 ("...there are no technical guidelines on how to provide these [PAC and abortion] services. The only wall charts I've seen are the ones IPAS gives out."); interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Nov. 3, 2009.
- <sup>750</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi/KNH, Nairobi, Nov. 3, 2009 ("They [the MOH] don't have anything – we should urge them to have PAC guidelines.)
- <sup>751</sup> Ministry of Health (Kenya), Essential Obstetric Care Manual: for Health Service Providers in Kenya 68-79 (3<sup>rd ed. Jan. 2006).</sup>
- <sup>752</sup> Interview with Dr. Joseph Karanja, Professor of OB/GYN, University of Nairobi, Nairobi, Nov. 3, 2009.
- <sup>753</sup> Interview with Dr. Aggrey Otieno Akula, Medical Superintendent, Kisumu East District Hospital, Kisumu, July 27, 2009.
   <sup>754</sup> Id.
- <sup>755</sup> MOH Post Abortion Care Trainer's Manual.
   <sup>756</sup> Interview with Dr. Joachim Osur
  - Interview with Dr. Joachim Osur, reproductive health expert, Nairobi, Nov. 2, 2009.
- <sup>757</sup> 2004 KSPAS at 148. Drawing upon the UN Process Indicators for Emergency Obstetric Care to measure "certain types of obstetric services that were understood to have a direct bearing on maternal outcomes, including mortality and morbidity," the 2004 KSPAS looked at five critical services considered essential to basic emergency obstetric care. These services included the administration of parenteral antibiotics and parenteral oxytocic drugs and the removal of retained products of conception, all of which can be critical to post-abortion care. *Id.* at 146.
- <sup>758</sup> 2004 KSPAS at 148.
  - Id. Comprehensive emergency obstetric services are defined by the 2004 KSPAS as basic services plus the capacity to perform Cesarean delivery and blood transfusions, the latter sometimes being a critical aspect of PAC. 2004 KSPAS at 147.
- <sup>760</sup> *Id.* at 33.
   <sup>761</sup> *Id.*

762

Ipas, available at http://www.ipas.org/ Products.aspx (last visited Feb. 9, 2010).

- <sup>763</sup> Ipas, Processing Ipas MVA Plus® Aspirators and Adapters (2007), *available at* http:// www.ipas.org/Publications/asset\_upload\_ file72\_3241.pdf (last visited Feb. 9, 2010).
- <sup>64</sup> 2004 KSPAS at 32, with hospitals (37%), maternities (36%), clinics (39%) and health centres (23%) having varying water supply capacities. Overall, 26%



120 Wall Street New York, New York 10005 Tel 917 637 3600 Fax 917 637 3666 www.reproductiverights.org